

New Heavy Bosons (W' , Z' , leptoquarks, etc.), Searches for

We list here various limits on charged and neutral heavy vector bosons (other than W 's and Z 's), heavy scalar bosons (other than Higgs bosons), vector or scalar leptoquarks, and axigluons. The latest unpublished results are described in " W' Searches" and " Z' Searches" reviews. For recent searches on scalar bosons which could be identified as Higgs bosons, see the listings in the Higgs boson section.

CONTENTS:

Mass Limits for W' (Heavy Charged Vector Boson Other Than W) in Hadron Collider Experiments

W_R (Right-Handed W Boson) Mass Limits

Limit on W_L - W_R Mixing Angle ζ

Mass Limits for Z' (Heavy Neutral Vector Boson Other Than Z)

– Limits for Z'_{SM}

– Limits for Z'_{LR}

– Limits for Z'_χ

– Limits for Z'_{ψ}

– Limits for Z'_η

– Limits for other Z'

Indirect Constraints on Kaluza-Klein Gauge Bosons

Mass Limits for Leptoquarks from Pair Production

Mass Limits for Leptoquarks from Single Production

Indirect Limits for Leptoquarks

Mass Limits for Diquarks

Mass Limits for g_A (axigluon) and Other Color-Octet Gauge Bosons

Mass Limits for Color-Octet Scalar Bosons

X^0 (Heavy Boson) Searches in Z Decays

Mass Limits for a Heavy Neutral Boson Coupling to e^+e^-

Search for X^0 Resonance in e^+e^- Collisions

Search for X^0 Resonance in $e p$ Collisions

Search for X^0 Resonance in Two-Photon Process

Search for X^0 Resonance in $e^+e^- \rightarrow X^0\gamma$

Search for X^0 Resonance in $Z \rightarrow f\bar{f}X^0$

Search for X^0 Resonance in $W X^0$ final state

Search for X^0 Resonance in Quarkonium Decays

A REVIEW GOES HERE – Check our WWW List of Reviews

MASS LIMITS for W' (Heavy Charged Vector Boson Other Than W) in Hadron Collider Experiments

Couplings of W' to quarks and leptons are taken to be identical with those of W . The following limits are obtained from $p\bar{p}$ or $pp \rightarrow W'X$ with W' decaying to the mode indicated in the comments. New decay channels (e.g., $W' \rightarrow WZ$) are assumed to

be suppressed. The most recent preliminary results can be found in the “ W' -boson searches” review above.

| VALUE (GeV) | CL% | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|---|-----|--------------------|-----------|--------------------------------------|
| none 400–1590 | 95 | 1 AAD | 15AU ATLS | $W' \rightarrow WZ$ |
| none 1500–1760 | 95 | 2 AAD | 15AV ATLS | $W' \rightarrow tb$ |
| none 300–1490 | 95 | 3 AAD | 15AZ ATLS | $W' \rightarrow WZ$ |
| none 1300–1500 | 95 | 4 AAD | 15CP ATLS | $W' \rightarrow WZ$ |
| none 500–1920 | 95 | 5 AAD | 15R ATLS | $W' \rightarrow tb$ |
| none 800–2450 | 95 | 6 AAD | 15V ATLS | $W' \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ |
| >1470 | 95 | 7 KHACHATRY...15C | CMS | $W' \rightarrow WZ$ |
| >3710 | 95 | 8 KHACHATRY...15T | CMS | $W' \rightarrow e\nu, \mu\nu$ |
| none 1200–1900 and 2000–2200 | 95 | 9 KHACHATRY...15V | CMS | $W' \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ |
| >3240 | 95 | AAD | 14AI ATLS | $W' \rightarrow e\nu, \mu\nu$ |
| none 200–1520 | 95 | 10 AAD | 14S ATLS | $W' \rightarrow WZ$ |
| none 1000–1700 | 95 | 11 KHACHATRY...14 | CMS | $W' \rightarrow WZ$ |
| none 1000–3010 | 95 | 12 KHACHATRY...14O | CMS | $W' \rightarrow Nl \rightarrow lljj$ |
| none 800–1510 | 95 | 13 CHATRCHYAN 13E | CMS | $W' \rightarrow tb$ |
| ● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ● | | | | |
| none 300–880 | 95 | 14 AAD | 15BB ATLS | $W' \rightarrow Wh$ |
| | | 15 AALTONEN | 15C CDF | $W' \rightarrow tb$ |
| | | 16 AAD | 14AT ATLS | $W' \rightarrow W\gamma$ |
| | | 17 KHACHATRY...14A | CMS | $W' \rightarrow WZ$ |
| none 500–950 | 95 | 18 AAD | 13AO ATLS | $W' \rightarrow WZ$ |
| none 1100–1680 | 95 | AAD | 13D ATLS | $W' \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ |
| none 1000–1920 | 95 | CHATRCHYAN 13A | CMS | $W' \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ |
| | | 19 CHATRCHYAN 13AJ | CMS | $W' \rightarrow WZ$ |
| >2900 | 95 | 20 CHATRCHYAN 13AQ | CMS | $W' \rightarrow e\nu, \mu\nu$ |
| none 700–940 | 95 | 21 CHATRCHYAN 13U | CMS | $W' \rightarrow WZ$ |
| none 700–1130 | 95 | 22 AAD | 12AV ATLS | $W' \rightarrow tb$ |
| none 200–760 | 95 | 23 AAD | 12BB ATLS | $W' \rightarrow WZ$ |
| | | 24 AAD | 12CK ATLS | $W' \rightarrow \bar{t}q$ |
| >2550 | 95 | 25 AAD | 12CR ATLS | $W' \rightarrow e\nu, \mu\nu$ |
| | | 26 AAD | 12M ATLS | $W' \rightarrow Nl \rightarrow lljj$ |
| | | 27 AALTONEN | 12N CDF | $W' \rightarrow \bar{t}q$ |
| none 200–1143 | 95 | 23 CHATRCHYAN 12AF | CMS | $W' \rightarrow WZ$ |
| | | 28 CHATRCHYAN 12AR | CMS | $W' \rightarrow \bar{t}q$ |
| | | 29 CHATRCHYAN 12BG | CMS | $W' \rightarrow Nl \rightarrow lljj$ |
| >1120 | 95 | AALTONEN | 11C CDF | $W' \rightarrow e\nu$ |
| none 180–690 | 95 | 30 ABAZOV | 11H D0 | $W' \rightarrow WZ$ |
| none 600–863 | 95 | 31 ABAZOV | 11L D0 | $W' \rightarrow tb$ |
| none 285–516 | 95 | 32 AALTONEN | 10N CDF | $W' \rightarrow WZ$ |
| none 280–840 | 95 | 33 AALTONEN | 09AC CDF | $W' \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ |
| >1000 | 95 | ABAZOV | 08C D0 | $W' \rightarrow e\nu$ |
| none 300–800 | 95 | ABAZOV | 04C D0 | $W' \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ |
| none 225–536 | 95 | 34 ACOSTA | 03B CDF | $W' \rightarrow tb$ |
| none 200–480 | 95 | 35 AFFOLDER | 02C CDF | $W' \rightarrow WZ$ |

| | | | | | |
|--------------|----|-------------|-----|------|--------------------------------|
| > 786 | 95 | 36 AFFOLDER | 01I | CDF | $W' \rightarrow e\nu, \mu\nu$ |
| none 300–420 | 95 | 37 ABE | 97G | CDF | $W' \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ |
| > 720 | 95 | 38 ABACHI | 96C | D0 | $W' \rightarrow e\nu$ |
| > 610 | 95 | 39 ABACHI | 95E | D0 | $W' \rightarrow e\nu, \tau\nu$ |
| none 260–600 | 95 | 40 RIZZO | 93 | RVUE | $W' \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ |

- ¹ AAD 15AU search for W' decaying into the WZ final state with $W \rightarrow q\bar{q}'$, $Z \rightarrow \ell^+ \ell^-$ using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV. The quoted limit assumes $g_{W'WZ}/g_{WWZ} = (M_W/M_{W'})^2$.
- ² AAD 15AV limit is for a SM like right-handed W' using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV. $W' \rightarrow \ell\nu$ decay is assumed to be forbidden.
- ³ AAD 15AZ search for W' decaying into the WZ final state with $W \rightarrow \ell\nu$, $Z \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV. The quoted limit assumes $g_{W'WZ}/g_{WWZ} = (M_W/M_{W'})^2$.
- ⁴ AAD 15CP search for W' decaying into the WZ final state with $W \rightarrow q\bar{q}$, $Z \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV. The quoted limit assumes $g_{W'WZ}/g_{WWZ} = (M_W/M_{W'})^2$.
- ⁵ AAD 15R limit is for a SM like right-handed W' using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV. $W' \rightarrow \ell\nu$ decay is assumed to be forbidden.
- ⁶ AAD 15V search for new resonance decaying to dijets in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV.
- ⁷ KHACHATRYAN 15C search for W' decaying via WZ to fully leptonic final states using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s}=8$ TeV. The quoted limit assumes $g_{W'WZ}/g_{WWZ} = M_W M_Z/M_{W'}^2$.
- ⁸ KHACHATRYAN 15T limit is for W' with SM-like coupling which interferes the SM W boson constructively using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV. For W' without interference, the limit becomes > 3280 GeV.
- ⁹ KHACHATRYAN 15V search new resonance decaying to dijets in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV.
- ¹⁰ AAD 14S search for W' decaying into the WZ final state with $W \rightarrow \ell\nu$, $Z \rightarrow \ell\ell$ using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s}=8$ TeV. The quoted limit assumes $g_{W'WZ}/g_{WWZ} = (M_W/M_{W'})^2$.
- ¹¹ KHACHATRYAN 14 search for W' decaying into WZ final state with $W \rightarrow q\bar{q}$, $Z \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s}=8$ TeV. The quoted limit assumes $g_{W'WZ}/g_{WWZ} = (M_W/M_{W'})^2$.
- ¹² KHACHATRYAN 140 search for right-handed W_R in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV. W_R is assumed to decay into ℓ and hypothetical heavy neutrino N , with N decaying into ℓjj . The quoted limit is for $M_{\nu_{eR}} = M_{\nu_{\mu R}} = M_{W_R}/2$. See their Fig. 3 and Fig. 5 for excluded regions in the $M_{W_R} - M_\nu$ plane.
- ¹³ CHATRCHYAN 13E limit is for W' with SM-like coupling which intereferes with the SM W boson using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s}=7$ TeV. For W' with right-handed coupling, the bound becomes >1850 GeV (>1910 GeV) if W' decays to both leptons and quarks (only to quarks). If both left- and right-handed couplings are present, the limit becomes >1640 GeV.
- ¹⁴ AAD 15BB search for W' decaying into Wh with $W \rightarrow \ell\nu$, $h \rightarrow b\bar{b}$. See their Fig. 4 for the exclusion limits in the heavy vector triplet benchmark model parameter space.
- ¹⁵ AALTONEN 15C limit is for a SM-like right-handed W' assuming $W' \rightarrow \ell\nu$ decays are forbidden, using $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s}=1.96$ TeV. See their Fig. 3 for limit on $g_{W'}/g_W$.

- 16 AAD 14AT search for a narrow charged vector boson decaying to $W\gamma$. See their Fig. 3a for the exclusion limit in $m_{W'} - \sigma B$ plane.
- 17 KHACHATRYAN 14A search for W' decaying into the WZ final state with $W \rightarrow \ell\nu$, $Z \rightarrow q\bar{q}$, or $W \rightarrow q\bar{q}$, $Z \rightarrow \ell\ell$. pp collisions data at $\sqrt{s}=8$ TeV are used for the search. See their Fig. 13 for the exclusion limit on the number of events in the mass-width plane.
- 18 AAD 13AO search for W' decaying into the WZ final state with $W \rightarrow \ell\nu$, $Z \rightarrow 2j$ using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s}=7$ TeV. The quoted limit assumes $g_{W'WZ}/g_{WWZ} = (M_W/M_{W'})^2$.
- 19 CHATRCHYAN 13AJ search for resonances decaying to WZ pair, using the hadronic decay modes of W and Z , in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s}=7$ TeV. See their Fig. 7 for the limit on the cross section.
- 20 CHATRCHYAN 13AQ limit is for W' with SM-like coupling which interferes with the SM W boson using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s}=7$ TeV.
- 21 CHATRCHYAN 13U search for W' decaying to the WZ final state, with W decaying into jets, in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s}=7$ TeV. The quoted limit assumes $g_{W'WZ}/g_{WWZ} = (M_W/M_{W'})^2$.
- 22 The AAD 12AV quoted limit is for a SM-like right-handed W' using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s}=7$ TeV. $W' \rightarrow \ell\nu$ decay is assumed to be forbidden.
- 23 AAD 12BB use pp collisions data at $\sqrt{s}=7$ TeV. The quoted limit assumes $g_{W'WZ}/g_{WWZ} = (M_W/M_{W'})^2$.
- 24 AAD 12CK search for $pp \rightarrow tW'$, $W' \rightarrow \bar{t}q$ events in pp collisions. See their Fig. 5 for the limit on $\sigma \cdot B$.
- 25 AAD 12CR use pp collisions at $\sqrt{s}=7$ TeV.
- 26 AAD 12M search for right-handed W_R in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV. W_R is assumed to decay into ℓ and hypothetical heavy neutrino N , with N decaying into ℓjj . See their Fig. 4 for the limit in the $m_N - m_{W'}$ plane.
- 27 AALTONEN 12N search for $p\bar{p} \rightarrow tW'$, $W' \rightarrow \bar{t}d$ events in $p\bar{p}$ collisions. See their Fig. 3 for the limit on $\sigma \cdot B$.
- 28 CHATRCHYAN 12AR search for $pp \rightarrow tW'$, $W' \rightarrow \bar{t}d$ events in pp collisions. See their Fig. 2 for the limit on $\sigma \cdot B$.
- 29 CHATRCHYAN 12BG search for right-handed W_R in pp collisions $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV. W_R is assumed to decay into ℓ and hypothetical heavy neutrino N , with N decaying into ℓjj . See their Fig. 3 for the limit in the $m_N - m_{W'}$ plane.
- 30 ABAZOV 11H use data from $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s}=1.96$ TeV. The quoted limit is obtained assuming $W'WZ$ coupling strength is the same as the ordinary WWZ coupling strength in the Standard Model.
- 31 ABAZOV 11L limit is for W' with SM-like coupling which interferes with the SM W boson, using $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s}=1.96$ TeV. For W' with right-handed coupling, the bound becomes >885 GeV (>890 GeV) if W' decays to both leptons and quarks (only to quarks). If both left- and right-handed couplings present, the limit becomes >916 GeV.
- 32 AALTONEN 10N use $p\bar{p}$ collision data at $\sqrt{s}=1.96$ TeV. The quoted limit assumes $g_{W'WZ}/g_{WWZ} = (M_W/M_{W'})^2$. See their Fig. 4 for limits in mass-coupling plane.
- 33 AALTONEN 09AC search for new particle decaying to dijets using $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s}=1.96$ TeV.
- 34 The ACOSTA 03B quoted limit is for $M_{W'} \gg M_{\nu_R}$, using $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s}=1.8$ TeV. For $M_{W'} < M_{\nu_R}$, $M_{W'}$ between 225 and 566 GeV is excluded.
- 35 The quoted limit is obtained assuming $W'WZ$ coupling strength is the same as the ordinary WWZ coupling strength in the Standard Model, using $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s}=1.8$ TeV. See their Fig. 2 for the limits on the production cross sections as a function of the W' width.

- 36 AFFOLDER 01I combine a new bound on $W' \rightarrow e\nu$ of 754 GeV, using $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s}=1.8$ TeV, with the bound of ABE 00 on $W' \rightarrow \mu\nu$ to obtain quoted bound.
- 37 ABE 97G search for new particle decaying to dijets using $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s}=1.8$ TeV.
- 38 For bounds on W_R with nonzero right-handed mass, see Fig. 5 from ABACHI 96C.
- 39 ABACHI 95E assume that the decay $W' \rightarrow WZ$ is suppressed and that the neutrino from W' decay is stable and has a mass significantly less $m_{W'}$.
- 40 RIZZO 93 analyses CDF limit on possible two-jet resonances. The limit is sensitive to the inclusion of the assumed K factor.

W_R (Right-Handed W Boson) MASS LIMITS

Assuming a light right-handed neutrino, except for BEALL 82, LANGACKER 89B, and COLANGELO 91. $g_R = g_L$ assumed. [Limits in the section MASS LIMITS for W' below are also valid for W_R if $m_{\nu_R} \ll m_{W_R}$.] Some limits assume manifest left-right symmetry, *i.e.*, the equality of left- and right Cabibbo-Kobayashi-Maskawa matrices. For a comprehensive review, see LANGACKER 89B. Limits on the W_L - W_R mixing angle ζ are found in the next section. Values in brackets are from cosmological and astrophysical considerations and assume a light right-handed neutrino.

| VALUE (GeV) | CL% | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|---|-----|------------------------------|------|---------------------------------|
| > 592 | 90 | ¹ BUENO 11 | TWST | μ decay |
| > 715 | 90 | ² CZAKON 99 | RVUE | Electroweak |
| ● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ● | | | | |
| > 235 | 90 | ³ PRIEELS 14 | PIE3 | μ decay |
| > 245 | 90 | ⁴ WAUTERS 10 | CNTR | ⁶⁰ Co β decay |
| >2500 | | ⁵ ZHANG 08 | THEO | $m_{K_L^0} - m_{K_S^0}$ |
| > 180 | 90 | ⁶ MELCONIAN 07 | CNTR | ³⁷ K β^+ decay |
| > 290.7 | 90 | ⁷ SCHUMANN 07 | CNTR | Polarized neutron decay |
| [> 3300] | 95 | ⁸ CYBURT 05 | COSM | Nucleosynthesis; light ν_R |
| > 310 | 90 | ⁹ THOMAS 01 | CNTR | β^+ decay |
| > 137 | 95 | ¹⁰ ACKERSTAFF 99D | OPAL | τ decay |
| >1400 | 68 | ¹¹ BARENBOIM 98 | RVUE | Electroweak, Z - Z' mixing |
| > 549 | 68 | ¹² BARENBOIM 97 | RVUE | μ decay |
| > 220 | 95 | ¹³ STAHL 97 | RVUE | τ decay |
| > 220 | 90 | ¹⁴ ALLET 96 | CNTR | β^+ decay |
| > 281 | 90 | ¹⁵ KUZNETSOV 95 | CNTR | Polarized neutron decay |
| > 282 | 90 | ¹⁶ KUZNETSOV 94B | CNTR | Polarized neutron decay |
| > 439 | 90 | ¹⁷ BHATTACH... 93 | RVUE | Z - Z' mixing |
| > 250 | 90 | ¹⁸ SEVERIJNS 93 | CNTR | β^+ decay |
| | | ¹⁹ IMAZATO 92 | CNTR | K^+ decay |
| > 475 | 90 | ²⁰ POLAK 92B | RVUE | μ decay |
| > 240 | 90 | ²¹ AQUINO 91 | RVUE | Neutron decay |
| > 496 | 90 | ²¹ AQUINO 91 | RVUE | Neutron and muon decay |
| > 700 | | ²² COLANGELO 91 | THEO | $m_{K_L^0} - m_{K_S^0}$ |
| > 477 | 90 | ²³ POLAK 91 | RVUE | μ decay |
| [none 540–23000] | | ²⁴ BARBIERI 89B | ASTR | SN 1987A; light ν_R |
| > 300 | 90 | ²⁵ LANGACKER 89B | RVUE | General |
| > 160 | 90 | ²⁶ BALKE 88 | CNTR | $\mu \rightarrow e\nu\bar{\nu}$ |
| > 406 | 90 | ²⁷ JODIDIO 86 | ELEC | Any ζ |
| > 482 | 90 | ²⁷ JODIDIO 86 | ELEC | $\zeta = 0$ |

| | | | | |
|-------|----|--------------|------|--|
| > 800 | | MOHAPATRA 86 | RVUE | $SU(2)_L \times SU(2)_R \times U(1)$ |
| > 400 | 95 | 28 STOKER | 85 | ELEC Any ζ |
| > 475 | 95 | 28 STOKER | 85 | ELEC $\zeta < 0.041$ |
| | | 29 BERGSMA | 83 | CHRM $\nu_\mu e \rightarrow \mu \nu_e$ |
| > 380 | 90 | 30 CARR | 83 | ELEC μ^+ decay |
| >1600 | | 31 BEALL | 82 | THEO $m_{K_L^0} - m_{K_S^0}$ |

¹ The quoted limit is for manifest left-right symmetric model.

² CZAKON 99 perform a simultaneous fit to charged and neutral sectors.

³ PRIEELS 14 limit is from $\mu^+ \rightarrow e^+ \nu \bar{\nu}$ decay parameter ξ'' , which is determined by the positron polarization measurement.

⁴ WAUTERS 10 limit is from a measurement of the asymmetry parameter of polarized ^{60}Co β decays. The listed limit assumes no mixing.

⁵ ZHANG 08 limit uses a lattice QCD calculation of the relevant hadronic matrix elements, while BEALL 82 limit used the vacuum saturation approximation.

⁶ MELCONIAN 07 measure the neutrino angular asymmetry in β^+ -decays of polarized ^{37}K , stored in a magneto-optical trap. Result is consistent with SM prediction and does not constrain the $W_L - W_R$ mixing angle appreciably.

⁷ SCHUMANN 07 limit is from measurements of the asymmetry $\langle \vec{p}_\nu \cdot \sigma_n \rangle$ in the β decay of polarized neutrons. Zero mixing is assumed.

⁸ CYBURT 05 limit follows by requiring that three light ν_R 's decouple when $T_{dec} > 140$ MeV. For different T_{dec} , the bound becomes $M_{W_R} > 3.3 \text{ TeV} (T_{dec} / 140 \text{ MeV})^{3/4}$.

⁹ THOMAS 01 limit is from measurement of β^+ polarization in decay of polarized ^{12}N . The listed limit assumes no mixing.

¹⁰ ACKERSTAFF 99D limit is from τ decay parameters. Limit increase to 145 GeV for zero mixing.

¹¹ BARENBOIM 98 assumes minimal left-right model with Higgs of $SU(2)_R$ in $SU(2)_L$ doublet. For Higgs in $SU(2)_L$ triplet, $m_{W_R} > 1100$ GeV. Bound calculated from effect of corresponding Z_{LR} on electroweak data through $Z-Z_{LR}$ mixing.

¹² The quoted limit is from μ decay parameters. BARENBOIM 97 also evaluate limit from $K_L - K_S$ mass difference.

¹³ STAHL 97 limit is from fit to τ -decay parameters.

¹⁴ ALLET 96 measured polarization-asymmetry correlation in $^{12}\text{N} \beta^+$ decay. The listed limit assumes zero $L-R$ mixing.

¹⁵ KUZNETSOV 95 limit is from measurements of the asymmetry $\langle \vec{p}_\nu \cdot \sigma_n \rangle$ in the β decay of polarized neutrons. Zero mixing assumed. See also KUZNETSOV 94B.

¹⁶ KUZNETSOV 94B limit is from measurements of the asymmetry $\langle \vec{p}_\nu \cdot \sigma_n \rangle$ in the β decay of polarized neutrons. Zero mixing assumed.

¹⁷ BHATTACHARYYA 93 uses $Z-Z'$ mixing limit from LEP '90 data, assuming a specific Higgs sector of $SU(2)_L \times SU(2)_R \times U(1)$ gauge model. The limit is for $m_t = 200$ GeV and slightly improves for smaller m_t .

¹⁸ SEVERIJNS 93 measured polarization-asymmetry correlation in $^{107}\text{In} \beta^+$ decay. The listed limit assumes zero $L-R$ mixing. Value quoted here is from SEVERIJNS 94 erratum.

¹⁹ IMAZATO 92 measure positron asymmetry in $K^+ \rightarrow \mu^+ \nu_\mu$ decay and obtain $\xi_{P_\mu} > 0.990$ (90% CL). If W_R couples to $u\bar{s}$ with full weak strength ($V_{us}^R = 1$), the result corresponds to $m_{W_R} > 653$ GeV. See their Fig. 4 for m_{W_R} limits for general

$$|V_{us}^R|^2 = 1 - |V_{ud}^R|^2.$$

²⁰ POLAK 92B limit is from fit to muon decay parameters and is essentially determined by JODIDIO 86 data assuming $\zeta = 0$. Supersedes POLAK 91.

²¹ AQUINO 91 limits obtained from neutron lifetime and asymmetries together with unitarity of the CKM matrix. Manifest left-right symmetry assumed. Stronger of the two limits also includes muon decay results.

- 22 COLANGELO 91 limit uses hadronic matrix elements evaluated by QCD sum rule and is less restrictive than BEALL 82 limit which uses vacuum saturation approximation. Manifest left-right symmetry assumed.
- 23 POLAK 91 limit is from fit to muon decay parameters and is essentially determined by JODIDIO 86 data assuming $\zeta=0$. Superseded by POLAK 92B.
- 24 BARBIERI 89B limit holds for $m_{\nu_R} \leq 10$ MeV.
- 25 LANGACKER 89B limit is for any ν_R mass (either Dirac or Majorana) and for a general class of right-handed quark mixing matrices.
- 26 BALKE 88 limit is for $m_{\nu_{eR}} = 0$ and $m_{\nu_{\mu R}} \leq 50$ MeV. Limits come from precise measurements of the muon decay asymmetry as a function of the positron energy.
- 27 JODIDIO 86 is the same TRIUMF experiment as STOKER 85 (and CARR 83); however, it uses a different technique. The results given here are combined results of the two techniques. The technique here involves precise measurement of the end-point e^+ spectrum in the decay of the highly polarized μ^+ .
- 28 STOKER 85 is same TRIUMF experiment as CARR 83. Here they measure the decay e^+ spectrum asymmetry above 46 MeV/c using a muon-spin-rotation technique. Assumed a light right-handed neutrino. Quoted limits are from combining with CARR 83.
- 29 BERGSMA 83 set limit $m_{W_2}/m_{W_1} > 1.9$ at CL = 90%.
- 30 CARR 83 is TRIUMF experiment with a highly polarized μ^+ beam. Looked for deviation from $V-A$ at the high momentum end of the decay e^+ energy spectrum. Limit from previous world-average muon polarization parameter is $m_{W_R} > 240$ GeV. Assumes a light right-handed neutrino.
- 31 BEALL 82 limit is obtained assuming that W_R contribution to $K_L^0-K_S^0$ mass difference is smaller than the standard one, neglecting the top quark contributions. Manifest left-right symmetry assumed.

Limit on W_L - W_R Mixing Angle ζ

Lighter mass eigenstate $W_1 = W_L \cos \zeta - W_R \sin \zeta$. Light ν_R assumed unless noted. Values in brackets are from cosmological and astrophysical considerations.

| VALUE | CL% | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|---|-----|-----------------------------|------|-----------------------------------|
| ● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ● | | | | |
| -0.020 to 0.017 | 90 | BUENO 11 | TWST | $\mu \rightarrow e \nu \bar{\nu}$ |
| < 0.022 | 90 | MACDONALD 08 | TWST | $\mu \rightarrow e \nu \bar{\nu}$ |
| < 0.12 | 95 | ¹ ACKERSTAFF 99D | OPAL | τ decay |
| < 0.013 | 90 | ² CZAKON 99 | RVUE | Electroweak |
| < 0.0333 | | ³ BARENBOIM 97 | RVUE | μ decay |
| < 0.04 | 90 | ⁴ MISHRA 92 | CCFR | νN scattering |
| -0.0006 to 0.0028 | 90 | ⁵ AQUINO 91 | RVUE | |
| [none 0.00001-0.02] | | ⁶ BARBIERI 89B | ASTR | SN 1987A |
| < 0.040 | 90 | ⁷ JODIDIO 86 | ELEC | μ decay |
| -0.056 to 0.040 | 90 | ⁷ JODIDIO 86 | ELEC | μ decay |

¹ ACKERSTAFF 99D limit is from τ decay parameters.

² CZAKON 99 perform a simultaneous fit to charged and neutral sectors.

³ The quoted limit is from μ decay parameters. BARENBOIM 97 also evaluate limit from K_L-K_S mass difference.

⁴ MISHRA 92 limit is from the absence of extra large- x , large- y $\bar{\nu}_\mu N \rightarrow \bar{\nu}_\mu X$ events at Tevatron, assuming left-handed ν and right-handed $\bar{\nu}$ in the neutrino beam. The result gives $\zeta^2(1-2m_{W_1}^2/m_{W_2}^2) < 0.0015$. The limit is independent of ν_R mass.

⁵ AQUINO 91 limits obtained from neutron lifetime and asymmetries together with unitarity of the CKM matrix. Manifest left-right asymmetry is assumed.

⁶ BARBIERI 89B limit holds for $m_{\nu_R} \leq 10$ MeV.

⁷ First JODIDIO 86 result assumes $m_{W_R} = \infty$, second is for unconstrained m_{W_R} .

A REVIEW GOES HERE – Check our WWW List of Reviews

MASS LIMITS for Z' (Heavy Neutral Vector Boson Other Than Z)

Limits for Z'_{SM}

Z'_{SM} is assumed to have couplings with quarks and leptons which are identical to those of Z , and decays only to known fermions. The most recent preliminary results can be found in the “ Z' -boson searches” review above.

| VALUE (GeV) | CL% | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|---|-----|--------------------|-----------|---|
| >2020 | 95 | 1 AAD | 15AMATLS | $p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow \tau^+ \tau^-$ |
| >2900 | 95 | 2 KHACHATRY...15AE | CMS | $p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow e^+ e^-, \mu^+ \mu^-$ |
| none 1200–1700 | 95 | 3 KHACHATRY...15V | CMS | $p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ |
| >2900 | 95 | 4 AAD | 14V ATLS | $p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow e^+ e^-, \mu^+ \mu^-$ |
| >1470 | 95 | 5 CHATRCHYAN 13A | CMS | $p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ |
| >1400 | 95 | 6 CHATRCHYAN 120 | CMS | $p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow \tau^+ \tau^-$ |
| >1500 | 95 | 7 CHEUNG | 01B RVUE | Electroweak |
| ● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ● | | | | |
| >1400 | 95 | 8 AAD | 13S ATLS | $p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow \tau^+ \tau^-$ |
| >2590 | 95 | 9 CHATRCHYAN 13AF | CMS | $p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow e^+ e^-, \mu^+ \mu^-$ |
| >2220 | 95 | 10 AAD | 12CC ATLS | $p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow e^+ e^-, \mu^+ \mu^-$ |
| >1071 | 95 | 11 AALTONEN | 11I CDF | $p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow \mu^+ \mu^-$ |
| >1023 | 95 | 12 ABAZOV | 11A D0 | $p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow e^+ e^-$ |
| none 247–544 | 95 | 13 AALTONEN | 10N CDF | $Z' \rightarrow W W$ |
| none 320–740 | 95 | 14 AALTONEN | 09AC CDF | $Z' \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ |
| > 963 | 95 | 12 AALTONEN | 09T CDF | $p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow e^+ e^-$ |
| >1403 | 95 | 15 ERLER | 09 RVUE | Electroweak |
| >1305 | 95 | 16 ABDALLAH | 06C DLPH | $e^+ e^-$ |
| > 399 | 95 | 17 ACOSTA | 05R CDF | $p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow \tau^+ \tau^-$ |
| none 400–640 | 95 | ABAZOV | 04C D0 | $p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ |
| >1018 | 95 | 18 ABBIENDI | 04G OPAL | $e^+ e^-$ |
| > 670 | 95 | 19 ABAZOV | 01B D0 | $p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow e^+ e^-$ |
| > 710 | 95 | 20 ABREU | 00S DLPH | $e^+ e^-$ |
| > 898 | 95 | 21 BARATE | 00I ALEP | $e^+ e^-$ |
| > 809 | 95 | 22 ERLER | 99 RVUE | Electroweak |
| > 690 | 95 | 23 ABE | 97S CDF | $p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow e^+ e^-, \mu^+ \mu^-$ |
| > 398 | 95 | 24 VILAIN | 94B CHM2 | $\nu_\mu e \rightarrow \nu_\mu e$ and $\bar{\nu}_\mu e \rightarrow \bar{\nu}_\mu e$ |
| > 237 | 90 | 25 ALITTI | 93 UA2 | $p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ |
| none 260–600 | 95 | 26 RIZZO | 93 RVUE | $p\bar{p}; Z'_{SM} \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ |
| > 426 | 90 | 27 ABE | 90F VNS | $e^+ e^-$ |

- ¹ AAD 15AM search for resonances decaying to $\tau^+ \tau^-$ in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV.
- ² KHACHATRYAN 15AE search for resonances decaying to $e^+ e^-$, $\mu^+ \mu^-$ in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV.
- ³ KHACHATRYAN 15V search for resonances decaying to dijets in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV.
- ⁴ AAD 14V search for resonances decaying to $e^+ e^-$, $\mu^+ \mu^-$ in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV.
- ⁵ CHATRCHYAN 13A use pp collisions at $\sqrt{s}=7$ TeV.
- ⁶ CHATRCHYAN 120 search for resonances decaying to $\tau^+ \tau^-$ in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV.
- ⁷ CHEUNG 01B limit is derived from bounds on contact interactions in a global electroweak analysis.
- ⁸ AAD 13S search for resonances decaying to $\tau^+ \tau^-$ in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV.
- ⁹ CHATRCHYAN 13AF search for resonances decaying to $e^+ e^-$, $\mu^+ \mu^-$ in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV and 8 TeV.
- ¹⁰ AAD 12CC search for resonances decaying to $e^+ e^-$, $\mu^+ \mu^-$ in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV.
- ¹¹ AALTONEN 11I search for resonances decaying to $\mu^+ \mu^-$ in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV.
- ¹² ABAZOV 11A, AALTONEN 09T, AALTONEN 07H, and ABULENCIA 06L search for resonances decaying to $e^+ e^-$ in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV.
- ¹³ The quoted limit assumes $g_{WWZ'}/g_{WWZ} = (M_W/M_{Z'})^2$. See their Fig. 4 for limits in mass-coupling plane.
- ¹⁴ AALTONEN 09AC search for new particle decaying to dijets.
- ¹⁵ ERLER 09 give 95% CL limit on the Z - Z' mixing $-0.0026 < \theta < 0.0006$.
- ¹⁶ ABDALLAH 06C use data $\sqrt{s} = 130$ – 207 GeV.
- ¹⁷ ACOSTA 05R search for resonances decaying to tau lepton pairs in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV.
- ¹⁸ ABBIENDI 04G give 95% CL limit on Z - Z' mixing $-0.00422 < \theta < 0.00091$. $\sqrt{s} = 91$ to 207 GeV.
- ¹⁹ ABAZOV 01B search for resonances in $p\bar{p} \rightarrow e^+ e^-$ at $\sqrt{s}=1.8$ TeV. They find $\sigma \cdot B(Z' \rightarrow ee) < 0.06$ pb for $M_{Z'} > 500$ GeV.
- ²⁰ ABREU 00S uses LEP data at $\sqrt{s}=90$ to 189 GeV.
- ²¹ BARATE 00I search for deviations in cross section and asymmetries in $e^+ e^- \rightarrow$ fermions at $\sqrt{s}=90$ to 183 GeV. Assume $\theta=0$. Bounds in the mass-mixing plane are shown in their Figure 18.
- ²² ERLER 99 give 90%CL limit on the Z - Z' mixing $-0.0041 < \theta < 0.0003$. $\rho_0=1$ is assumed.
- ²³ ABE 97S find $\sigma(Z') \times B(e^+ e^-, \mu^+ \mu^-) < 40$ fb for $m_{Z'} > 600$ GeV at $\sqrt{s}= 1.8$ TeV.
- ²⁴ VILAIN 94B assume $m_t = 150$ GeV.
- ²⁵ ALITTI 93 search for resonances in the two-jet invariant mass. The limit assumes $B(Z' \rightarrow q\bar{q})=0.7$. See their Fig. 5 for limits in the $m_{Z'}-B(q\bar{q})$ plane.
- ²⁶ RIZZO 93 analyses CDF limit on possible two-jet resonances.
- ²⁷ ABE 90F use data for R , $R_{\ell\ell}$, and $A_{\ell\ell}$. They fix $m_W = 80.49 \pm 0.43 \pm 0.24$ GeV and $m_Z = 91.13 \pm 0.03$ GeV.

Limits for Z_{LR}

Z_{LR} is the extra neutral boson in left-right symmetric models. $g_L = g_R$ is assumed unless noted. Values in parentheses assume stronger constraint on the Higgs sector, usually motivated by specific left-right symmetric models (see the Note on the W'). Values in brackets are from cosmological and astrophysical considerations and assume a light right-handed neutrino. Direct search bounds assume decays to Standard Model fermions only, unless noted.

| VALUE (GeV) | CL% | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|---|-----|----------------------------|----------|---|
| >1162 | 95 | ¹ DEL-AGUILA 10 | RVUE | Electroweak |
| > 630 | 95 | ² ABE | 97S CDF | $p\bar{p}; Z'_{LR} \rightarrow e^+e^-, \mu^+\mu^-$ |
| • • • We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. • • • | | | | |
| > 998 | 95 | ³ ERLER | 09 RVUE | Electroweak |
| > 600 | 95 | SCHAEL | 07A ALEP | e^+e^- |
| > 455 | 95 | ⁴ ABDALLAH | 06C DLPH | e^+e^- |
| > 518 | 95 | ⁵ ABBIENDI | 04G OPAL | e^+e^- |
| > 860 | 95 | ⁶ CHEUNG | 01B RVUE | Electroweak |
| > 380 | 95 | ⁷ ABREU | 00S DLPH | e^+e^- |
| > 436 | 95 | ⁸ BARATE | 00I ALEP | Repl. by SCHAEL 07A |
| > 550 | 95 | ⁹ CHAY | 00 RVUE | Electroweak |
| | | ¹⁰ ERLER | 00 RVUE | Cs |
| | | ¹¹ CASALBUONI | 99 RVUE | Cs |
| (> 1205) | 90 | ¹² CZAKON | 99 RVUE | Electroweak |
| > 564 | 95 | ¹³ ERLER | 99 RVUE | Electroweak |
| (> 1673) | 95 | ¹⁴ ERLER | 99 RVUE | Electroweak |
| (> 1700) | 68 | ¹⁵ BARENBOIM | 98 RVUE | Electroweak |
| > 244 | 95 | ¹⁶ CONRAD | 98 RVUE | $\nu_\mu N$ scattering |
| > 253 | 95 | ¹⁷ VILAIN | 94B CHM2 | $\nu_\mu e \rightarrow \nu_\mu e$ and $\bar{\nu}_\mu e \rightarrow \bar{\nu}_\mu e$ |
| none 200–600 | 95 | ¹⁸ RIZZO | 93 RVUE | $p\bar{p}; Z_{LR} \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ |
| [> 2000] | | WALKER | 91 COSM | Nucleosynthesis; light ν_R |
| none 200–500 | | ¹⁹ GRIFOLS | 90 ASTR | SN 1987A; light ν_R |
| none 350–2400 | | ²⁰ BARBIERI | 89B ASTR | SN 1987A; light ν_R |

¹ DEL-AGUILA 10 give 95% CL limit on the Z - Z' mixing $-0.0012 < \theta < 0.0004$.

² ABE 97S find $\sigma(Z') \times B(e^+e^-, \mu^+\mu^-) < 40$ fb for $m_{Z'} > 600$ GeV at $\sqrt{s} = 1.8$ TeV.

³ ERLER 09 give 95% CL limit on the Z - Z' mixing $-0.0013 < \theta < 0.0006$.

⁴ ABDALLAH 06C give 95% CL limit $|\theta| < 0.0028$. See their Fig. 14 for limit contours in the mass-mixing plane.

⁵ ABBIENDI 04G give 95% CL limit on Z - Z' mixing $-0.00098 < \theta < 0.00190$. See their Fig. 20 for the limit contour in the mass-mixing plane. $\sqrt{s} = 91$ to 207 GeV.

⁶ CHEUNG 01B limit is derived from bounds on contact interactions in a global electroweak analysis.

⁷ ABREU 00S give 95% CL limit on Z - Z' mixing $|\theta| < 0.0018$. See their Fig. 6 for the limit contour in the mass-mixing plane. $\sqrt{s} = 90$ to 189 GeV.

⁸ BARATE 00I search for deviations in cross section and asymmetries in $e^+e^- \rightarrow$ fermions at $\sqrt{s} = 90$ to 183 GeV. Assume $\theta = 0$. Bounds in the mass-mixing plane are shown in their Figure 18.

⁹ CHAY 00 also find $-0.0003 < \theta < 0.0019$. For g_R free, $m_{Z'} > 430$ GeV.

¹⁰ ERLER 00 discuss the possibility that a discrepancy between the observed and predicted values of $Q_W(\text{Cs})$ is due to the exchange of Z' . The data are better described in a certain class of the Z' models including Z_{LR} and Z_χ .

- 11 CASALBUONI 99 discuss the discrepancy between the observed and predicted values of $Q_W(\text{Cs})$. It is shown that the data are better described in a class of models including the Z_{LR} model.
- 12 CZAKON 99 perform a simultaneous fit to charged and neutral sectors. Assumes manifest left-right symmetric model. Finds $|\theta| < 0.0042$.
- 13 ERLER 99 give 90% CL limit on the Z - Z' mixing $-0.0009 < \theta < 0.0017$.
- 14 ERLER 99 assumes 2 Higgs doublets, transforming as 10 of $\text{SO}(10)$, embedded in E_6 .
- 15 BARENBOIM 98 also gives 68% CL limits on the Z - Z' mixing $-0.0005 < \theta < 0.0033$. Assumes Higgs sector of minimal left-right model.
- 16 CONRAD 98 limit is from measurements at CCFR, assuming no Z - Z' mixing.
- 17 VILAIN 94B assume $m_t = 150$ GeV and $\theta=0$. See Fig. 2 for limit contours in the mass-mixing plane.
- 18 RIZZO 93 analyses CDF limit on possible two-jet resonances.
- 19 GRIFOLS 90 limit holds for $m_{\nu_R} \lesssim 1$ MeV. A specific Higgs sector is assumed. See also GRIFOLS 90D, RIZZO 91.
- 20 BARBIERI 89B limit holds for $m_{\nu_R} \leq 10$ MeV. Bounds depend on assumed supernova core temperature.

Limits for Z_χ

Z_χ is the extra neutral boson in $\text{SO}(10) \rightarrow \text{SU}(5) \times \text{U}(1)_\chi$. $g_\chi = e/\cos\theta_W$ is assumed unless otherwise stated. We list limits with the assumption $\rho = 1$ but with no further constraints on the Higgs sector. Values in parentheses assume stronger constraint on the Higgs sector motivated by superstring models. Values in brackets are from cosmological and astrophysical considerations and assume a light right-handed neutrino.

| <u>VALUE (GeV)</u> | <u>CL%</u> | <u>DOCUMENT ID</u> | <u>TECN</u> | <u>COMMENT</u> |
|---|------------|--------------------|-------------|--|
| >2620 | 95 | 1 AAD | 14V ATLS | $p\bar{p}, Z'_\chi \rightarrow e^+e^-, \mu^+\mu^-$ |
| >1141 | 95 | 2 ERLER | 09 RVUE | Electroweak |
| ● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ● | | | | |
| >1970 | 95 | 3 AAD | 12CC ATLS | $p\bar{p}, Z'_\chi \rightarrow e^+e^-, \mu^+\mu^-$ |
| > 930 | 95 | 4 AALTONEN | 11I CDF | $p\bar{p}; Z'_\chi \rightarrow \mu^+\mu^-$ |
| > 903 | 95 | 5 ABAZOV | 11A D0 | $p\bar{p}, Z'_\chi \rightarrow e^+e^-$ |
| >1022 | 95 | 6 DEL-AGUILA | 10 RVUE | Electroweak |
| > 862 | 95 | 5 AALTONEN | 09T CDF | $p\bar{p}, Z'_\chi \rightarrow e^+e^-$ |
| > 892 | 95 | 7 AALTONEN | 09V CDF | Repl. by AALTONEN 11I |
| > 822 | 95 | 5 AALTONEN | 07H CDF | Repl. by AALTONEN 09T |
| > 680 | 95 | SCHAEL | 07A ALEP | e^+e^- |
| > 545 | 95 | 8 ABDALLAH | 06C DLPH | e^+e^- |
| > 740 | 95 | 5 ABULENCIA | 06L CDF | Repl. by AALTONEN 07H |
| > 690 | 95 | 9 ABULENCIA | 05A CDF | $p\bar{p}; Z'_\chi \rightarrow e^+e^-, \mu^+\mu^-$ |
| > 781 | 95 | 10 ABBIENDI | 04G OPAL | e^+e^- |
| >2100 | | 11 BARGER | 03B COSM | Nucleosynthesis; light ν_R |
| > 680 | 95 | 12 CHEUNG | 01B RVUE | Electroweak |
| > 440 | 95 | 13 ABREU | 00S DLPH | e^+e^- |
| > 533 | 95 | 14 BARATE | 00I ALEP | Repl. by SCHAEL 07A |
| > 554 | 95 | 15 CHO | 00 RVUE | Electroweak |
| | | 16 ERLER | 00 RVUE | Cs |
| | | 17 ROSNER | 00 RVUE | Cs |

| | | | | | | |
|----------|----|----|-------------|-----|------|--|
| > 545 | 95 | 18 | ERLER | 99 | RVUE | Electroweak |
| (> 1368) | 95 | 19 | ERLER | 99 | RVUE | Electroweak |
| > 215 | 95 | 20 | CONRAD | 98 | RVUE | $\nu_\mu N$ scattering |
| > 595 | 95 | 21 | ABE | 97S | CDF | $p\bar{p}; Z'_\chi \rightarrow e^+e^-, \mu^+\mu^-$ |
| > 190 | 95 | 22 | ARIMA | 97 | VNS | Bhabha scattering |
| > 262 | 95 | 23 | VILAIN | 94B | CHM2 | $\nu_\mu e \rightarrow \nu_\mu e; \bar{\nu}_\mu e \rightarrow \bar{\nu}_\mu e$ |
| [>1470] | | 24 | FARAGGI | 91 | COSM | Nucleosynthesis; light ν_R |
| > 231 | 90 | 25 | ABE | 90F | VNS | e^+e^- |
| [> 1140] | | 26 | GONZALEZ-G. | 90D | COSM | Nucleosynthesis; light ν_R |
| [> 2100] | | 27 | GRIFOLS | 90 | ASTR | SN 1987A; light ν_R |

¹ AAD 14V search for resonances decaying to $e^+e^-, \mu^+\mu^-$ in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV.

² ERLER 09 give 95% CL limit on the Z - Z' mixing $-0.0016 < \theta < 0.0006$.

³ AAD 12CC search for resonances decaying to $e^+e^-, \mu^+\mu^-$ in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV.

⁴ AALTONEN 11I search for resonances decaying to $\mu^+\mu^-$ in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV.

⁵ ABAZOV 11A, AALTONEN 09T, AALTONEN 07H, and ABULENCIA 06L search for resonances decaying to e^+e^- in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV.

⁶ DEL-AGUILA 10 give 95% CL limit on the Z - Z' mixing $-0.0011 < \theta < 0.0007$.

⁷ AALTONEN 09V search for resonances decaying to $\mu^+\mu^-$ in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV.

⁸ ABDALLAH 06C give 95% CL limit $|\theta| < 0.0031$. See their Fig. 14 for limit contours in the mass-mixing plane.

⁹ ABULENCIA 05A search for resonances decaying to electron or muon pairs in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV.

¹⁰ ABBIENDI 04G give 95% CL limit on Z - Z' mixing $-0.00099 < \theta < 0.00194$. See their Fig. 20 for the limit contour in the mass-mixing plane. $\sqrt{s} = 91$ to 207 GeV.

¹¹ BARGER 03B limit is from the nucleosynthesis bound on the effective number of light neutrino $\delta N_\nu < 1$. The quark-hadron transition temperature $T_c = 150$ MeV is assumed. The limit with $T_c = 400$ MeV is > 4300 GeV.

¹² CHEUNG 01B limit is derived from bounds on contact interactions in a global electroweak analysis.

¹³ ABREU 00S give 95% CL limit on Z - Z' mixing $|\theta| < 0.0017$. See their Fig. 6 for the limit contour in the mass-mixing plane. $\sqrt{s} = 90$ to 189 GeV.

¹⁴ BARATE 00I search for deviations in cross section and asymmetries in $e^+e^- \rightarrow$ fermions at $\sqrt{s} = 90$ to 183 GeV. Assume $\theta = 0$. Bounds in the mass-mixing plane are shown in their Figure 18.

¹⁵ CHO 00 use various electroweak data to constrain Z' models assuming $m_H = 100$ GeV. See Fig. 3 for limits in the mass-mixing plane.

¹⁶ ERLER 00 discuss the possibility that a discrepancy between the observed and predicted values of $Q_W(Cs)$ is due to the exchange of Z' . The data are better described in a certain class of the Z' models including Z_{LR} and Z_χ .

¹⁷ ROSNER 00 discusses the possibility that a discrepancy between the observed and predicted values of $Q_W(Cs)$ is due to the exchange of Z' . The data are better described in a certain class of the Z' models including Z_χ .

¹⁸ ERLER 99 give 90% CL limit on the Z - Z' mixing $-0.0020 < \theta < 0.0015$.

¹⁹ ERLER 99 assumes 2 Higgs doublets, transforming as 10 of $SO(10)$, embedded in E_6 .

²⁰ CONRAD 98 limit is from measurements at CCFR, assuming no Z - Z' mixing.

²¹ ABE 97S find $\sigma(Z') \times B(e^+e^-, \mu^+\mu^-) < 40$ fb for $m_{Z'} > 600$ GeV at $\sqrt{s} = 1.8$ TeV.

²² Z - Z' mixing is assumed to be zero. $\sqrt{s} = 57.77$ GeV.

- ²³ VILAIN 94B assume $m_t = 150$ GeV and $\theta=0$. See Fig. 2 for limit contours in the mass-mixing plane.
- ²⁴ FARAGGI 91 limit assumes the nucleosynthesis bound on the effective number of neutrinos $\Delta N_\nu < 0.5$ and is valid for $m_{\nu_R} < 1$ MeV.
- ²⁵ ABE 90F use data for R , $R_{\ell\ell}$, and $A_{\ell\ell}$. ABE 90F fix $m_W = 80.49 \pm 0.43 \pm 0.24$ GeV and $m_Z = 91.13 \pm 0.03$ GeV.
- ²⁶ Assumes the nucleosynthesis bound on the effective number of light neutrinos ($\delta N_\nu < 1$) and that ν_R is light ($\lesssim 1$ MeV).
- ²⁷ GRIFOLS 90 limit holds for $m_{\nu_R} \lesssim 1$ MeV. See also GRIFOLS 90D, RIZZO 91.

Limits for Z_ψ

Z_ψ is the extra neutral boson in $E_6 \rightarrow SO(10) \times U(1)_\psi$. $g_\psi = e/\cos\theta_W$ is assumed unless otherwise stated. We list limits with the assumption $\rho = 1$ but with no further constraints on the Higgs sector. Values in brackets are from cosmological and astrophysical considerations and assume a light right-handed neutrino.

| VALUE (GeV) | CL% | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|---|-----|--------------------|-----------|--|
| >2570 | 95 | 1 KHACHATRY...15AE | CMS | $pp; Z'_\psi \rightarrow e^+ e^-, \mu^+ \mu^-$ |
| >2510 | 95 | 2 AAD | 14V ATLS | $pp, Z'_\psi \rightarrow e^+ e^-, \mu^+ \mu^-$ |
| >1100 | 95 | 3 CHATRCHYAN120 | CMS | $pp, Z'_\psi \rightarrow \tau^+ \tau^-$ |
| > 476 | 95 | 4 DEL-AGUILA | 10 RVUE | Electroweak |
| ● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ● | | | | |
| >2260 | 95 | 5 CHATRCHYAN13AF | CMS | $pp, Z'_\psi \rightarrow e^+ e^-, \mu^+ \mu^-$ |
| >1790 | 95 | 6 AAD | 12CC ATLS | $pp, Z'_\psi \rightarrow e^+ e^-, \mu^+ \mu^-$ |
| >2000 | 95 | 7 CHATRCHYAN12M | CMS | Repl. by CHATRCHYAN 13AF |
| > 917 | 95 | 8 AALTONEN | 11I CDF | $p\bar{p}; Z'_\psi \rightarrow \mu^+ \mu^-$ |
| > 891 | 95 | 9 ABAZOV | 11A D0 | $p\bar{p}, Z'_\psi \rightarrow e^+ e^-$ |
| > 851 | 95 | 9 AALTONEN | 09T CDF | $p\bar{p}, Z'_\psi \rightarrow e^+ e^-$ |
| > 878 | 95 | 10 AALTONEN | 09V CDF | Repl. by AALTONEN 11I |
| > 147 | 95 | 11 ERLER | 09 RVUE | Electroweak |
| > 822 | 95 | 9 AALTONEN | 07H CDF | Repl. by AALTONEN 09T |
| > 410 | 95 | SCHAEL | 07A ALEP | $e^+ e^-$ |
| > 475 | 95 | 12 ABDALLAH | 06C DLPH | $e^+ e^-$ |
| > 725 | | 9 ABULENCIA | 06L CDF | Repl. by AALTONEN 07H |
| > 675 | 95 | 13 ABULENCIA | 05A CDF | Repl. by AALTONEN 11I and AALTONEN 09T |
| > 366 | 95 | 14 ABBIENDI | 04G OPAL | $e^+ e^-$ |
| > 600 | | 15 BARGER | 03B COSM | Nucleosynthesis; light ν_R |
| > 350 | 95 | 16 ABREU | 00S DLPH | $e^+ e^-$ |
| > 294 | 95 | 17 BARATE | 00I ALEP | Repl. by SCHAEL 07A |
| > 137 | 95 | 18 CHO | 00 RVUE | Electroweak |
| > 146 | 95 | 19 ERLER | 99 RVUE | Electroweak |
| > 54 | 95 | 20 CONRAD | 98 RVUE | $\nu_\mu N$ scattering |
| > 590 | 95 | 21 ABE | 97S CDF | $p\bar{p}; Z'_\psi \rightarrow e^+ e^-, \mu^+ \mu^-$ |
| > 135 | 95 | 22 VILAIN | 94B CHM2 | $\nu_\mu e \rightarrow \nu_\mu e; \bar{\nu}_\mu e \rightarrow \bar{\nu}_\mu e$ |
| > 105 | 90 | 23 ABE | 90F VNS | $e^+ e^-$ |
| [> 160] | | 24 GONZALEZ-G. | 90D COSM | Nucleosynthesis; light ν_R |
| [> 2000] | | 25 GRIFOLS | 90D ASTR | SN 1987A; light ν_R |

- ¹ KHACHATRYAN 15AE search for resonances decaying to e^+e^- , $\mu^+\mu^-$ in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV.
- ² AAD 14V search for resonances decaying to e^+e^- , $\mu^+\mu^-$ in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV.
- ³ CHATRCHYAN 12O search for resonances decaying to $\tau^+\tau^-$ in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV.
- ⁴ DEL-AGUILA 10 give 95% CL limit on the Z - Z' mixing $-0.0019 < \theta < 0.0007$.
- ⁵ CHATRCHYAN 13AF search for resonances decaying to e^+e^- , $\mu^+\mu^-$ in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV and 8 TeV.
- ⁶ AAD 12CC search for resonances decaying to e^+e^- , $\mu^+\mu^-$ in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV.
- ⁷ CHATRCHYAN 12M search for resonances decaying to e^+e^- or $\mu^+\mu^-$ in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV.
- ⁸ AALTONEN 11I search for resonances decaying to $\mu^+\mu^-$ in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV.
- ⁹ ABAZOV 11A, AALTONEN 09T, AALTONEN 07H, and ABULENCIA 06L search for resonances decaying to e^+e^- in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV.
- ¹⁰ AALTONEN 09V search for resonances decaying to $\mu^+\mu^-$ in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV.
- ¹¹ ERLER 09 give 95% CL limit on the Z - Z' mixing $-0.0018 < \theta < 0.0009$.
- ¹² ABDALLAH 06C give 95% CL limit $|\theta| < 0.0027$. See their Fig. 14 for limit contours in the mass-mixing plane.
- ¹³ ABULENCIA 05A search for resonances decaying to electron or muon pairs in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV.
- ¹⁴ ABBIENDI 04G give 95% CL limit on Z - Z' mixing $-0.00129 < \theta < 0.00258$. See their Fig. 20 for the limit contour in the mass-mixing plane. $\sqrt{s} = 91$ to 207 GeV.
- ¹⁵ BARGER 03B limit is from the nucleosynthesis bound on the effective number of light neutrino $\delta N_\nu < 1$. The quark-hadron transition temperature $T_c = 150$ MeV is assumed. The limit with $T_c = 400$ MeV is > 1100 GeV.
- ¹⁶ ABREU 00S give 95% CL limit on Z - Z' mixing $|\theta| < 0.0018$. See their Fig. 6 for the limit contour in the mass-mixing plane. $\sqrt{s} = 90$ to 189 GeV.
- ¹⁷ BARATE 00I search for deviations in cross section and asymmetries in $e^+e^- \rightarrow$ fermions at $\sqrt{s} = 90$ to 183 GeV. Assume $\theta = 0$. Bounds in the mass-mixing plane are shown in their Figure 18.
- ¹⁸ CHO 00 use various electroweak data to constrain Z' models assuming $m_H = 100$ GeV. See Fig. 3 for limits in the mass-mixing plane.
- ¹⁹ ERLER 99 give 90% CL limit on the Z - Z' mixing $-0.0013 < \theta < 0.0024$.
- ²⁰ CONRAD 98 limit is from measurements at CCFR, assuming no Z - Z' mixing.
- ²¹ ABE 97S find $\sigma(Z') \times B(e^+e^-, \mu^+\mu^-) < 40$ fb for $m_{Z'} > 600$ GeV at $\sqrt{s} = 1.8$ TeV.
- ²² VILAIN 94B assume $m_t = 150$ GeV and $\theta = 0$. See Fig. 2 for limit contours in the mass-mixing plane.
- ²³ ABE 90F use data for R , $R_{\ell\ell}$, and $A_{\ell\ell}$. ABE 90F fix $m_W = 80.49 \pm 0.43 \pm 0.24$ GeV and $m_Z = 91.13 \pm 0.03$ GeV.
- ²⁴ Assumes the nucleosynthesis bound on the effective number of light neutrinos ($\delta N_\nu < 1$) and that ν_R is light ($\lesssim 1$ MeV).
- ²⁵ GRIFOLS 90D limit holds for $m_{\nu_R} \lesssim 1$ MeV. See also RIZZO 91.

Limits for Z_η

Z_η is the extra neutral boson in E_6 models, corresponding to $Q_\eta = \sqrt{3/8} Q_\chi - \sqrt{5/8} Q_\psi$. $g_\eta = e/\cos\theta_W$ is assumed unless otherwise stated. We list limits with the assumption $\rho = 1$ but with no further constraints on the Higgs sector. Values in parentheses assume stronger constraint on the Higgs sector motivated by superstring models. Values in brackets are from cosmological and astrophysical considerations and assume a light right-handed neutrino.

| VALUE (GeV) | CL% | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|---|-----|---------------------------|-----------|--|
| >1870 | 95 | ¹ AAD | 12CC ATLS | $pp, Z'_\eta \rightarrow e^+ e^-, \mu^+ \mu^-$ |
| > 619 | 95 | ² CHO | 00 RVUE | Electroweak |
| ● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ● | | | | |
| > 938 | 95 | ³ AALTONEN | 11I CDF | $p\bar{p}; Z'_\eta \rightarrow \mu^+ \mu^-$ |
| > 923 | 95 | ⁴ ABAZOV | 11A D0 | $p\bar{p}, Z'_\eta \rightarrow e^+ e^-$ |
| > 488 | 95 | ⁵ DEL-AGUILA | 10 RVUE | Electroweak |
| > 877 | 95 | ⁴ AALTONEN | 09T CDF | $p\bar{p}, Z'_\eta \rightarrow e^+ e^-$ |
| > 904 | 95 | ⁶ AALTONEN | 09V CDF | Repl. by AALTONEN 11I |
| > 427 | 95 | ⁷ ERLER | 09 RVUE | Electroweak |
| > 891 | 95 | ⁴ AALTONEN | 07H CDF | Repl. by AALTONEN 09T |
| > 350 | 95 | SCHAEL | 07A ALEP | $e^+ e^-$ |
| > 360 | 95 | ⁸ ABDALLAH | 06C DLPH | $e^+ e^-$ |
| > 745 | 95 | ⁴ ABULENCIA | 06L CDF | Repl. by AALTONEN 07H |
| > 720 | 95 | ⁹ ABULENCIA | 05A CDF | Repl. by AALTONEN 11I and AALTONEN 09T |
| > 515 | 95 | ¹⁰ ABBIENDI | 04G OPAL | $e^+ e^-$ |
| >1600 | | ¹¹ BARGER | 03B COSM | Nucleosynthesis; light ν_R |
| > 310 | 95 | ¹² ABREU | 00S DLPH | $e^+ e^-$ |
| > 329 | 95 | ¹³ BARATE | 00I ALEP | Repl. by SCHAEL 07A |
| > 365 | 95 | ¹⁴ ERLER | 99 RVUE | Electroweak |
| > 87 | 95 | ¹⁵ CONRAD | 98 RVUE | $\nu_\mu N$ scattering |
| > 620 | 95 | ¹⁶ ABE | 97S CDF | $p\bar{p}; Z'_\eta \rightarrow e^+ e^-, \mu^+ \mu^-$ |
| > 100 | 95 | ¹⁷ VILAIN | 94B CHM2 | $\nu_\mu e \rightarrow \nu_\mu e; \bar{\nu}_\mu e \rightarrow \bar{\nu}_\mu e$ |
| > 125 | 90 | ¹⁸ ABE | 90F VNS | $e^+ e^-$ |
| [> 820] | | ¹⁹ GONZALEZ-G. | 90D COSM | Nucleosynthesis; light ν_R |
| [> 3300] | | ²⁰ GRIFOLS | 90 ASTR | SN 1987A; light ν_R |
| [> 1040] | | ¹⁹ LOPEZ | 90 COSM | Nucleosynthesis; light ν_R |

¹ AAD 12CC search for resonances decaying to $e^+ e^-, \mu^+ \mu^-$ in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV.

² CHO 00 use various electroweak data to constrain Z' models assuming $m_H=100$ GeV. See Fig. 3 for limits in the mass-mixing plane.

³ AALTONEN 11I search for resonances decaying to $\mu^+ \mu^-$ in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV.

⁴ ABAZOV 11A, AALTONEN 09T, AALTONEN 07H, and ABULENCIA 06L search for resonances decaying to $e^+ e^-$ in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV.

⁵ DEL-AGUILA 10 give 95% CL limit on the $Z-Z'$ mixing $-0.0023 < \theta < 0.0027$.

⁶ AALTONEN 09V search for resonances decaying to $\mu^+ \mu^-$ in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV.

⁷ ERLER 09 give 95% CL limit on the $Z-Z'$ mixing $-0.0047 < \theta < 0.0021$.

⁸ ABDALLAH 06C give 95% CL limit $|\theta| < 0.0092$. See their Fig. 14 for limit contours in the mass-mixing plane.

- ⁹ ABULENCIA 05A search for resonances decaying to electron or muon pairs in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV.
- ¹⁰ ABBIENDI 04G give 95% CL limit on Z - Z' mixing $-0.00447 < \theta < 0.00331$. See their Fig. 20 for the limit contour in the mass-mixing plane. $\sqrt{s} = 91$ to 207 GeV.
- ¹¹ BARGER 03B limit is from the nucleosynthesis bound on the effective number of light neutrino $\delta N_\nu < 1$. The quark-hadron transition temperature $T_c=150$ MeV is assumed. The limit with $T_c=400$ MeV is >3300 GeV.
- ¹² ABREU 00S give 95% CL limit on Z - Z' mixing $|\theta| < 0.0024$. See their Fig. 6 for the limit contour in the mass-mixing plane. $\sqrt{s}=90$ to 189 GeV.
- ¹³ BARATE 00I search for deviations in cross section and asymmetries in $e^+ e^- \rightarrow$ fermions at $\sqrt{s}=90$ to 183 GeV. Assume $\theta=0$. Bounds in the mass-mixing plane are shown in their Figure 18.
- ¹⁴ ERLER 99 give 90% CL limit on the Z - Z' mixing $-0.0062 < \theta < 0.0011$.
- ¹⁵ CONRAD 98 limit is from measurements at CCFR, assuming no Z - Z' mixing.
- ¹⁶ ABE 97S find $\sigma(Z') \times B(e^+ e^-, \mu^+ \mu^-) < 40$ fb for $m_{Z'} > 600$ GeV at $\sqrt{s}=1.8$ TeV.
- ¹⁷ VILAIN 94B assume $m_t = 150$ GeV and $\theta=0$. See Fig.2 for limit contours in the mass-mixing plane.
- ¹⁸ ABE 90F use data for R , $R_{\ell\ell}$, and $A_{\ell\ell}$. ABE 90F fix $m_W = 80.49 \pm 0.43 \pm 0.24$ GeV and $m_Z = 91.13 \pm 0.03$ GeV.
- ¹⁹ These authors claim that the nucleosynthesis bound on the effective number of light neutrinos ($\delta N_\nu < 1$) constrains Z' masses if ν_R is light ($\lesssim 1$ MeV).
- ²⁰ GRIFOLS 90 limit holds for $m_{\nu_R} \lesssim 1$ MeV. See also GRIFOLS 90D, RIZZO 91.

Limits for other Z'

| VALUE (GeV) | CL% | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|---|-----|-------------------|-----------|---|
| ● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ● | | | | |
| >2400 | 95 | 1 KHACHATRY...16E | CMS | $Z' \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |
| | | 2 AAD | 15AO ATLS | $Z' \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |
| | | 3 AAD | 15AT ATLS | monotop |
| | | 4 AAD | 15CD ATLS | $h \rightarrow Z Z', Z' Z'; Z' \rightarrow \ell^+ \ell^-$ |
| | | 5 AAD | 15O ATLS | $Z' \rightarrow e\mu, e\tau, \mu\tau$ |
| | | 6 KHACHATRY...15F | CMS | monotop |
| | | 7 KHACHATRY...15O | CMS | $Z' \rightarrow hZ$ |
| | | 8 AAD | 14AT ATLS | $Z' \rightarrow Z\gamma$ |
| | | 9 KHACHATRY...14A | CMS | $Z' \rightarrow VV$ |
| | | 10 MARTINEZ | 14 RVUE | Electroweak |
| | | 11 AAD | 13AI ATLS | $Z' \rightarrow e\mu, e\tau, \mu\tau$ |
| none 500–1740 | 95 | 12 AAD | 13AQ ATLS | $Z' \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |
| >1320 or 1000–1280 | 95 | 13 AAD | 13G ATLS | $Z' \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |
| > 915 | 95 | 13 AALTONEN | 13A CDF | $Z' \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |
| >1300 | 95 | 14 CHATRCHYAN | 13AP CMS | $Z' \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |
| >2100 | 95 | 13 CHATRCHYAN | 13BMCMS | $Z' \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |
| | | 15 AAD | 12BV ATLS | $Z' \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |
| | | 16 AAD | 12K ATLS | $Z' \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |
| | | 17 AALTONEN | 12AR CDF | Chromophilic |
| | | 18 AALTONEN | 12N CDF | $Z' \rightarrow \bar{t}u$ |
| > 835 | 95 | 19 ABAZOV | 12R D0 | $Z' \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |

| | | | | | |
|-------|----|----|-----------------|----------|--------------------------------|
| | | 20 | CHATRCHYAN 12AI | CMS | $Z' \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |
| | | 21 | CHATRCHYAN 12AQ | CMS | $Z' \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |
| >1490 | 95 | 13 | CHATRCHYAN 12BL | CMS | $Z' \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |
| | | 22 | AAD | 11H ATLS | $Z' \rightarrow e\mu$ |
| | | 23 | AAD | 11Z ATLS | $Z' \rightarrow e\mu$ |
| | | 24 | AALTONEN | 11AD CDF | $Z' \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |
| | | 25 | AALTONEN | 11AE CDF | $Z' \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |
| | | 26 | CHATRCHYAN 11O | CMS | $pp \rightarrow tt$ |
| | | 27 | AALTONEN | 08D CDF | $Z' \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |
| | | 27 | AALTONEN | 08Y CDF | $Z' \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |
| | | 27 | ABAZOV | 08AA D0 | $Z' \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |
| | | 28 | ABULENCIA | 06M CDF | $Z' \rightarrow e\mu$ |
| | | 29 | ABAZOV | 04A D0 | Repl. by ABAZOV 08AA |
| | | 30 | BARGER | 03B COSM | Nucleosynthesis; light ν_R |
| | | 31 | CHO | 00 RVUE | E_6 -motivated |
| | | 32 | CHO | 98 RVUE | E_6 -motivated |
| | | 33 | ABE | 97G CDF | $Z' \rightarrow \bar{q}q$ |

¹ KHACHATRYAN 16E search for a leptophobic top-color Z' decaying to $t\bar{t}$ using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV. The quoted limit assumes that $\Gamma_{Z'}/m_{Z'} = 0.012$. Also $m_{Z'} < 2.9$ TeV is excluded for wider topcolor Z' with $\Gamma_{Z'}/m_{Z'} = 0.1$.

² AAD 15AO search for narrow resonance decaying to $t\bar{t}$ using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV. See Fig. 11 for limit on σB .

³ AAD 15AT search for monotop production plus large missing E_T events in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV and give constraints on a Z' model having $Z' u\bar{t}$ coupling. Z' is assumed to decay invisibly. See their Fig. 6 for limits on $\sigma \cdot B$.

⁴ AAD 15CD search for decays of Higgs bosons to 4 ℓ states via Z' bosons, $h \rightarrow ZZ' \rightarrow 4\ell$ or $h \rightarrow Z'Z' \rightarrow 4\ell$. See Fig. 5 for the limit on the signal strength of the $h \rightarrow ZZ' \rightarrow 4\ell$ process and Fig. 16 for the limit on $h \rightarrow Z'Z' \rightarrow 4\ell$.

⁵ AAD 15O search for new particle with lepton flavor violating decay in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV. See their Fig. 2 for limits on σB .

⁶ KHACHATRYAN 15F search for monotop production plus large missing E_T events in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV and give constraints on a Z' model having $Z' u\bar{t}$ coupling. Z' is assumed to decay invisibly. See Fig. 3 for limits on σB .

⁷ KHACHATRYAN 15O search for narrow Z' resonance decaying to Zh in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV. See their Fig. 6 for limit on σB .

⁸ AAD 14AT search for a narrow neutral vector boson decaying to $Z\gamma$. See their Fig. 3b for the exclusion limit in $m_{Z'} - \sigma B$ plane.

⁹ KHACHATRYAN 14A search for new resonance in the $WW (\ell\nu q\bar{q})$ and the $ZZ (\ell\ell q\bar{q})$ channels using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s}=8$ TeV. See their Fig.13 for the exclusion limit on the number of events in the mass-width plane.

¹⁰ MARTINEZ 14 use various electroweak data to constrain the Z' boson in the 3-3-1 models.

¹¹ AAD 13AI search for new particle with lepton flavor violating decay in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV. See their Fig. 2 for limits on $\sigma \cdot B$.

¹² AAD 13AQ search for a leptophobic top-color Z' decaying to $t\bar{t}$. The quoted limit assumes that $\Gamma_{Z'}/m_{Z'} = 0.012$.

¹³ CHATRCHYAN 13BM search for top-color Z' decaying to $t\bar{t}$ using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s}=8$ TeV. The quoted limit is for $\Gamma_{Z'}/m_{Z'} = 0.012$.

¹⁴ CHATRCHYAN 13AP search for top-color leptophobic Z' decaying to $t\bar{t}$ using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s}=7$ TeV. The quoted limit is for $\Gamma_{Z'}/m_{Z'} = 0.012$.

- 15 AAD 12BV search for narrow resonance decaying to $t\bar{t}$ using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s}=7$ TeV. See their Fig. 7 for limit on $\sigma \cdot B$.
- 16 AAD 12K search for narrow resonance decaying to $t\bar{t}$ using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s}=7$ TeV. See their Fig. 5 for limit on $\sigma \cdot B$.
- 17 AALTONEN 12AR search for chromophilic Z' in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV. See their Fig. 5 for limit on $\sigma \cdot B$.
- 18 AALTONEN 12N search for $p\bar{p} \rightarrow tZ'$, $Z' \rightarrow \bar{t}u$ events in $p\bar{p}$ collisions. See their Fig. 3 for the limit on $\sigma \cdot B$.
- 19 ABAZOV 12R search for top-color Z' boson decaying exclusively to $t\bar{t}$. The quoted limit is for $\Gamma_{Z'}/m_{Z'} = 0.012$.
- 20 CHATRCHYAN 12AI search for $pp \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ events and give constraints on a Z' model having $Z'\bar{u}t$ coupling. See their Fig. 4 for the limit in mass-coupling plane.
- 21 Search for resonance decaying to $t\bar{t}$. See their Fig. 6 for limit on $\sigma \cdot B$.
- 22 AAD 11H search for new particle with lepton flavor violating decay in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV. See their Fig. 3 for exclusion plot on the production cross section.
- 23 AAD 11Z search for new particle with lepton flavor violating decay in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV. See their Fig. 3 for limit on $\sigma \cdot B$.
- 24 Search for narrow resonance decaying to $t\bar{t}$. See their Fig. 4 for limit on $\sigma \cdot B$.
- 25 Search for narrow resonance decaying to $t\bar{t}$. See their Fig. 3 for limit on $\sigma \cdot B$.
- 26 CHATRCHYAN 110 search for same-sign top production in pp collisions induced by a hypothetical FCNC Z' at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV. See their Fig. 3 for limit in mass-coupling plane.
- 27 Search for narrow resonance decaying to $t\bar{t}$. See their Fig. 3 for limit on $\sigma \cdot B$.
- 28 ABULENCIA 06M search for new particle with lepton flavor violating decay at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV. See their Fig. 4 for an exclusion plot on a mass-coupling plane.
- 29 Search for narrow resonance decaying to $t\bar{t}$. See their Fig. 2 for limit on $\sigma \cdot B$.
- 30 BARGER 03B use the nucleosynthesis bound on the effective number of light neutrino δN_{ν} . See their Figs. 4–5 for limits in general E_6 motivated models.
- 31 CHO 00 use various electroweak data to constrain Z' models assuming $m_H=100$ GeV. See Fig. 2 for limits in general E_6 -motivated models.
- 32 CHO 98 study constraints on four-Fermi contact interactions obtained from low-energy electroweak experiments, assuming no Z - Z' mixing.
- 33 Search for Z' decaying to dijets at $\sqrt{s}=1.8$ TeV. For Z' with electromagnetic strength coupling, no bound is obtained.

Indirect Constraints on Kaluza-Klein Gauge Bosons

Bounds on a Kaluza-Klein excitation of the Z boson or photon in $d=1$ extra dimension. These bounds can also be interpreted as a lower bound on $1/R$, the size of the extra dimension. Unless otherwise stated, bounds assume all fermions live on a single brane and all gauge fields occupy the $4+d$ -dimensional bulk. See also the section on “Extra Dimensions” in the “Searches” Listings in this Review.

| VALUE (TeV) | CL% | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|---|-----|-------------|------|-------------------|
| ● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ● | | | | |
| > 4.7 | | 1 MUECK | 02 | RVUE Electroweak |
| > 3.3 | 95 | 2 CORNET | 00 | RVUE $e\nu qq'$ |
| >5000 | | 3 DELGADO | 00 | RVUE ϵ_K |
| > 2.6 | 95 | 4 DELGADO | 00 | RVUE Electroweak |
| > 3.3 | 95 | 5 RIZZO | 00 | RVUE Electroweak |
| > 2.9 | 95 | 6 MARCIANO | 99 | RVUE Electroweak |
| > 2.5 | 95 | 7 MASIP | 99 | RVUE Electroweak |
| > 1.6 | 90 | 8 NATH | 99 | RVUE Electroweak |
| > 3.4 | 95 | 9 STRUMIA | 99 | RVUE Electroweak |

- ¹ MUECK 02 limit is 2σ and is from global electroweak fit ignoring correlations among observables. Higgs is assumed to be confined on the brane and its mass is fixed. For scenarios of bulk Higgs, of brane-SU(2)_L, bulk-U(1)_Y, and of bulk-SU(2)_L, brane-U(1)_Y, the corresponding limits are > 4.6 TeV, > 4.3 TeV and > 3.0 TeV, respectively.
- ² Bound is derived from limits on $e\nu qq'$ contact interaction, using data from HERA and the Tevatron.
- ³ Bound holds only if first two generations of quarks lives on separate branes. If quark mixing is not complex, then bound lowers to 400 TeV from Δm_K .
- ⁴ See Figs. 1 and 2 of DELGADO 00 for several model variations. Special boundary conditions can be found which permit KK states down to 950 GeV and that agree with the measurement of $Q_W(\text{Cs})$. Quoted bound assumes all Higgs bosons confined to brane; placing one Higgs doublet in the bulk lowers bound to 2.3 TeV.
- ⁵ Bound is derived from global electroweak analysis assuming the Higgs field is trapped on the matter brane. If the Higgs propagates in the bulk, the bound increases to 3.8 TeV.
- ⁶ Bound is derived from global electroweak analysis but considering only presence of the KK W bosons.
- ⁷ Global electroweak analysis used to obtain bound independent of position of Higgs on brane or in bulk.
- ⁸ Bounds from effect of KK states on G_F , α , M_W , and M_Z . Hard cutoff at string scale determined using gauge coupling unification. Limits for $d=2,3,4$ rise to 3.5, 5.7, and 7.8 TeV.
- ⁹ Bound obtained for Higgs confined to the matter brane with $m_H=500$ GeV. For Higgs in the bulk, the bound increases to 3.5 TeV.

A REVIEW GOES HERE – Check our WWW List of Reviews

MASS LIMITS for Leptoquarks from Pair Production

These limits rely only on the color or electroweak charge of the leptoquark.

| VALUE (GeV) | CL% | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|---|-----|--------------------|-----------|-------------------------------|
| >1050 | 95 | 1 AAD | 16G ATLS | First generation |
| >1000 | 95 | 2 AAD | 16G ATLS | Second generation |
| > 625 | 95 | 3 AAD | 16G ATLS | Third generation |
| none 200–640 | 95 | 4 AAD | 16G ATLS | Third generation |
| > 685 | 95 | 5 KHACHATRY...15AJ | CMS | Third generation |
| > 740 | 95 | 6 KHACHATRY...14T | CMS | Third generation |
| > 534 | 95 | 7 AAD | 13AE ATLS | Third generation |
| > 830 | 95 | 8 CHATRCHYAN 12AG | CMS | First generation |
| > 840 | 95 | 9 CHATRCHYAN 12AG | CMS | Second generation |
| ● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ● | | | | |
| > 525 | 95 | 10 CHATRCHYAN 13M | CMS | Third generation |
| > 660 | 95 | 11 AAD | 12H ATLS | First generation |
| > 685 | 95 | 12 AAD | 12O ATLS | Second generation |
| > 450 | 95 | 13 CHATRCHYAN 12BO | CMS | Third generation |
| > 376 | 95 | 14 AAD | 11D ATLS | Superseded by AAD 12H |
| > 422 | 95 | 15 AAD | 11D ATLS | Superseded by AAD 12O |
| > 326 | 95 | 16 ABAZOV | 11V D0 | First generation |
| > 339 | 95 | 17 CHATRCHYAN 11N | CMS | Superseded by CHATRCHYAN 12AG |
| > 384 | 95 | 18 KHACHATRY...11D | CMS | Superseded by CHATRCHYAN 12AG |
| > 394 | 95 | 19 KHACHATRY...11E | CMS | Superseded by CHATRCHYAN 12AG |
| > 247 | 95 | 20 ABAZOV | 10L D0 | Third generation |
| > 316 | 95 | 21 ABAZOV | 09 D0 | Second generation |

| | | | | | | |
|----------------|----|-------|----------------|------|------|----------------------------|
| > 299 | 95 | 22 | ABAZOV | 09AF | D0 | Superseded by ABAZOV 11V |
| | | 23 | AALTONEN | 08P | CDF | Third generation |
| > 153 | 95 | 24 | AALTONEN | 08Z | CDF | Third generation |
| > 205 | 95 | 25 | ABAZOV | 08AD | D0 | All generations |
| > 210 | 95 | 24 | ABAZOV | 08AN | D0 | Third generation |
| > 229 | 95 | 26 | ABAZOV | 07J | D0 | Superseded by ABAZOV 10L |
| > 251 | 95 | 27 | ABAZOV | 06A | D0 | Superseded by ABAZOV 09 |
| > 136 | 95 | 28 | ABAZOV | 06L | D0 | Superseded by ABAZOV 08AD |
| > 226 | 95 | 29 | ABULENCIA | 06T | CDF | Second generation |
| > 256 | 95 | 30 | ABAZOV | 05H | D0 | First generation |
| > 117 | 95 | 25 | ACOSTA | 05I | CDF | First generation |
| > 236 | 95 | 31 | ACOSTA | 05P | CDF | First generation |
| > 99 | 95 | 32 | ABBIENDI | 03R | OPAL | First generation |
| > 100 | 95 | 32 | ABBIENDI | 03R | OPAL | Second generation |
| > 98 | 95 | 32 | ABBIENDI | 03R | OPAL | Third generation |
| > 98 | 95 | 33 | ABAZOV | 02 | D0 | All generations |
| > 225 | 95 | 34 | ABAZOV | 01D | D0 | First generation |
| > 85.8 | 95 | 35 | ABBIENDI | 00M | OPAL | Superseded by ABBIENDI 03R |
| > 85.5 | 95 | 35 | ABBIENDI | 00M | OPAL | Superseded by ABBIENDI 03R |
| > 82.7 | 95 | 35 | ABBIENDI | 00M | OPAL | Superseded by ABBIENDI 03R |
| > 200 | 95 | 36 | ABBOTT | 00C | D0 | Second generation |
| > 123 | 95 | 37 | AFFOLDER | 00K | CDF | Second generation |
| > 148 | 95 | 38 | AFFOLDER | 00K | CDF | Third generation |
| > 160 | 95 | 39 | ABBOTT | 99J | D0 | Second generation |
| > 225 | 95 | 40 | ABBOTT | 98E | D0 | First generation |
| > 94 | 95 | 41 | ABBOTT | 98J | D0 | Third generation |
| > 202 | 95 | 42 | ABE | 98S | CDF | Second generation |
| > 242 | 95 | 43 | GROSS-PILCH.98 | | | First generation |
| > 99 | 95 | 44 | ABE | 97F | CDF | Third generation |
| > 213 | 95 | 45 | ABE | 97X | CDF | First generation |
| > 45.5 | 95 | 46,47 | ABREU | 93J | DLPH | First + second generation |
| > 44.4 | 95 | 48 | ADRIANI | 93M | L3 | First generation |
| > 44.5 | 95 | 48 | ADRIANI | 93M | L3 | Second generation |
| > 45 | 95 | 48 | DECAMP | 92 | ALEP | Third generation |
| none 8.9–22.6 | 95 | 49 | KIM | 90 | AMY | First generation |
| none 10.2–23.2 | 95 | 49 | KIM | 90 | AMY | Second generation |
| none 5–20.8 | 95 | 50 | BARTEL | 87B | JADE | |
| none 7–20.5 | 95 | 51 | BEHREND | 86B | CELL | |

¹ AAD 16G search for scalar leptoquarks using $e e j j$ events in collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(eq) = 1$.

² AAD 16G search for scalar leptoquarks using $\mu \mu j j$ events in collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(\mu q) = 1$.

³ AAD 16G search for scalar leptoquarks decaying to $b\nu$. The limit above assumes $B(b\nu) = 1$.

⁴ AAD 16G search for scalar leptoquarks decaying to $t\nu$. The limit above assumes $B(t\nu) = 1$.

⁵ KHACHATRYAN 15AJ search for scalar leptoquarks using $\tau \tau t t$ events in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(\tau t) = 1$.

⁶ KHACHATRYAN 14T search for scalar leptoquarks decaying to τb using pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(\tau b) = 1$. See their Fig. 5 for exclusion limit as function of $B(\tau b)$.

- 7 AAD 13AE search for scalar leptoquarks using $\tau\tau bb$ events in pp collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 7$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(\tau b) = 1$.
- 8 CHATRCHYAN 12AG search for scalar leptoquarks using $eejj$ and $e\nu jj$ events in pp collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 7$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(eq) = 1$. For $B(eq) = 0.5$, the limit becomes 640 GeV.
- 9 CHATRCHYAN 12AG search for scalar leptoquarks using $\mu\mu jj$ and $\mu\nu jj$ events in pp collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 7$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(\mu q) = 1$. For $B(\mu q) = 0.5$, the limit becomes 650 GeV.
- 10 CHATRCHYAN 13M search for scalar and vector leptoquarks decaying to τb in pp collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 7$ TeV. The limit above is for scalar leptoquarks with $B(\tau b) = 1$.
- 11 AAD 12H search for scalar leptoquarks using $eejj$ and $e\nu jj$ events in pp collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 7$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(eq) = 1$. For $B(eq) = 0.5$, the limit becomes 607 GeV.
- 12 AAD 12O search for scalar leptoquarks using $\mu\mu jj$ and $\mu\nu jj$ events in pp collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 7$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(\mu q) = 1$. For $B(\mu q) = 0.5$, the limit becomes 594 GeV.
- 13 CHATRCHYAN 12B0 search for scalar leptoquarks decaying to νb in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(\nu b) = 1$.
- 14 AAD 11D search for scalar leptoquarks using $eejj$ and $e\nu jj$ events in pp collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 7$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(eq) = 1$. For $B(eq) = 0.5$, the limit becomes 319 GeV.
- 15 AAD 11D search for scalar leptoquarks using $\mu\mu jj$ and $\mu\nu jj$ events in pp collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 7$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(\mu q) = 1$. For $B(\mu q) = 0.5$, the limit becomes 362 GeV.
- 16 ABAZOV 11V search for scalar leptoquarks using $e\nu jj$ events in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.96$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(eq) = 0.5$.
- 17 CHATRCHYAN 11N search for scalar leptoquarks using $e\nu jj$ events in pp collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 7$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(eq) = 0.5$.
- 18 KHACHATRYAN 11D search for scalar leptoquarks using $eejj$ events in pp collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 7$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(eq) = 1$.
- 19 KHACHATRYAN 11E search for scalar leptoquarks using $\mu\mu jj$ events in pp collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 7$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(\mu q) = 1$.
- 20 ABAZOV 10L search for pair productions of scalar leptoquark state decaying to νb in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.96$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(\nu b) = 1$.
- 21 ABAZOV 09 search for scalar leptoquarks using $\mu\mu jj$ and $\mu\nu jj$ events in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.96$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(\mu q) = 1$. For $B(\mu q) = 0.5$, the limit becomes 270 GeV.
- 22 ABAZOV 09AF search for scalar leptoquarks using $eejj$ and $e\nu jj$ events in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.96$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(eq) = 1$. For $B(eq) = 0.5$ the bound becomes 284 GeV.
- 23 AALTONEN 08P search for vector leptoquarks using $\tau^+\tau^- b\bar{b}$ events in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.96$ TeV. Assuming Yang-Mills (minimal) couplings, the mass limit is >317 GeV (251 GeV) at 95% CL for $B(\tau b) = 1$.
- 24 Search for pair production of scalar leptoquark state decaying to τb in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.96$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(\tau b) = 1$.
- 25 Search for scalar leptoquarks using $\nu\nu jj$ events in $\bar{p}p$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.96$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(\nu q) = 1$.
- 26 ABAZOV 07J search for pair productions of scalar leptoquark state decaying to νb in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.96$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(\nu b) = 1$.
- 27 ABAZOV 06A search for scalar leptoquarks using $\mu\mu jj$ events in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.8$ TeV and 1.96 TeV. The limit above assumes $B(\mu q) = 1$. For $B(\mu q) = 0.5$, the limit becomes 204 GeV.
- 28 ABAZOV 06L search for scalar leptoquarks using $\nu\nu jj$ events in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.8$ TeV and at 1.96 TeV. The limit above assumes $B(\nu q) = 1$.
- 29 ABULENCIA 06T search for scalar leptoquarks using $\mu\mu jj$, $\mu\nu jj$, and $\nu\nu jj$ events in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.96$ TeV. The quoted limit assumes $B(\mu q) = 1$. For $B(\mu q) =$

- 0.5 or 0.1, the bound becomes 208 GeV or 143 GeV, respectively. See their Fig. 4 for the exclusion limit as a function of $B(\mu q)$.
- 30 ABAZOV 05H search for scalar leptoquarks using $eejj$ and $e\nu jj$ events in $\bar{p}p$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.8$ TeV and 1.96 TeV. The limit above assumes $B(eq) = 1$. For $B(eq) = 0.5$ the bound becomes 234 GeV.
 - 31 ACOSTA 05P search for scalar leptoquarks using $eejj$, $e\nu jj$ events in $\bar{p}p$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.96$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(eq) = 1$. For $B(eq) = 0.5$ and 0.1, the bound becomes 205 GeV and 145 GeV, respectively.
 - 32 ABBIENDI 03R search for scalar/vector leptoquarks in e^+e^- collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 189$ –209 GeV. The quoted limits are for charge $-4/3$ isospin 0 scalar-leptoquark with $B(\ell q) = 1$. See their table 12 for other cases.
 - 33 ABAZOV 02 search for scalar leptoquarks using $\nu\nu jj$ events in $\bar{p}p$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.8$ TeV. The bound holds for all leptoquark generations. Vector leptoquarks are likewise constrained to lie above 200 GeV.
 - 34 ABAZOV 01D search for scalar leptoquarks using $e\nu jj$, $eejj$, and $\nu\nu jj$ events in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.8$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(eq) = 1$. For $B(eq) = 0.5$ and 0, the bound becomes 204 and 79 GeV, respectively. Bounds for vector leptoquarks are also given. Supersedes ABBOTT 98E.
 - 35 ABBIENDI 00M search for scalar/vector leptoquarks in e^+e^- collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 183$ GeV. The quoted limits are for charge $-4/3$ isospin 0 scalar-leptoquarks with $B(\ell q) = 1$. See their Table 8 and Figs. 6–9 for other cases.
 - 36 ABBOTT 00C search for scalar leptoquarks using $\mu\mu jj$, $\mu\nu jj$, and $\nu\nu jj$ events in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.8$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(\mu q) = 1$. For $B(\mu q) = 0.5$ and 0, the bound becomes 180 and 79 GeV respectively. Bounds for vector leptoquarks are also given.
 - 37 AFFOLDER 00K search for scalar leptoquark using $\nu\nu cc$ events in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.8$ TeV. The quoted limit assumes $B(\nu c) = 1$. Bounds for vector leptoquarks are also given.
 - 38 AFFOLDER 00K search for scalar leptoquark using $\nu\nu bb$ events in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.8$ TeV. The quoted limit assumes $B(\nu b) = 1$. Bounds for vector leptoquarks are also given.
 - 39 ABBOTT 99J search for leptoquarks using $\mu\nu jj$ events in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.8$ TeV. The quoted limit is for a scalar leptoquark with $B(\mu q) = B(\nu q) = 0.5$. Limits on vector leptoquarks range from 240 to 290 GeV.
 - 40 ABBOTT 98E search for scalar leptoquarks using $e\nu jj$, $eejj$, and $\nu\nu jj$ events in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.8$ TeV. The limit above assumes $B(eq) = 1$. For $B(eq) = 0.5$ and 0, the bound becomes 204 and 79 GeV, respectively.
 - 41 ABBOTT 98J search for charge $-1/3$ third generation scalar and vector leptoquarks in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.8$ TeV. The quoted limit is for scalar leptoquark with $B(\nu b) = 1$.
 - 42 ABE 98S search for scalar leptoquarks using $\mu\mu jj$ events in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.8$ TeV. The limit is for $B(\mu q) = 1$. For $B(\mu q) = B(\nu q) = 0.5$, the limit is > 160 GeV.
 - 43 GROSS-PILCHER 98 is the combined limit of the CDF and $D\bar{O}$ Collaborations as determined by a joint CDF/ $D\bar{O}$ working group and reported in this FNAL Technical Memo. Original data published in ABE 97X and ABBOTT 98E.
 - 44 ABE 97F search for third generation scalar and vector leptoquarks in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.8$ TeV. The quoted limit is for scalar leptoquark with $B(\tau b) = 1$.
 - 45 ABE 97X search for scalar leptoquarks using $eejj$ events in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.8$ TeV. The limit is for $B(eq) = 1$.
 - 46 Limit is for charge $-1/3$ isospin-0 leptoquark with $B(\ell q) = 2/3$.
 - 47 First and second generation leptoquarks are assumed to be degenerate. The limit is slightly lower for each generation.
 - 48 Limits are for charge $-1/3$, isospin-0 scalar leptoquarks decaying to $\ell^- q$ or νq with any branching ratio. See paper for limits for other charge-isospin assignments of leptoquarks.
 - 49 KIM 90 assume pair production of charge $2/3$ scalar-leptoquark via photon exchange. The decay of the first (second) generation leptoquark is assumed to be any mixture of $d e^+$ and $u \bar{\nu}$ ($s \mu^+$ and $c \bar{\nu}$). See paper for limits for specific branching ratios.

⁵⁰ BARTEL 87B limit is valid when a pair of charge $2/3$ spinless leptoquarks X is produced with point coupling, and when they decay under the constraint $B(X \rightarrow c\bar{\nu}_\mu) + B(X \rightarrow s\mu^+) = 1$.

⁵¹ BEHREND 86B assumed that a charge $2/3$ spinless leptoquark, χ , decays either into $s\mu^+$ or $c\bar{\nu}$: $B(\chi \rightarrow s\mu^+) + B(\chi \rightarrow c\bar{\nu}) = 1$.

MASS LIMITS for Leptoquarks from Single Production

These limits depend on the q - ℓ -leptoquark coupling g_{LQ} . It is often assumed that $g_{LQ}^2/4\pi=1/137$. Limits shown are for a scalar, weak isoscalar, charge $-1/3$ leptoquark.

| VALUE (GeV) | CL% | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|---|-----|----------------------------|------|-------------------------|
| >304 | 95 | ¹ ABRAMOWICZ12A | ZEUS | First generation |
| > 73 | 95 | ² ABREU 93J | DLPH | Second generation |
| • • • We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. • • • | | | | |
| | | ³ AARON 11A | H1 | Lepton-flavor violation |
| >300 | 95 | ⁴ AARON 11B | H1 | First generation |
| | | ⁵ ABAZOV 07E | D0 | Second generation |
| >295 | 95 | ⁶ AKTAS 05B | H1 | First generation |
| | | ⁷ CHEKANOV 05A | ZEUS | Lepton-flavor violation |
| >298 | 95 | ⁸ CHEKANOV 03B | ZEUS | First generation |
| >197 | 95 | ⁹ ABBIENDI 02B | OPAL | First generation |
| | | ¹⁰ CHEKANOV 02 | ZEUS | Repl. by CHEKANOV 05A |
| >290 | 95 | ¹¹ ADLOFF 01C | H1 | First generation |
| >204 | 95 | ¹² BREITWEG 01 | ZEUS | First generation |
| | | ¹³ BREITWEG 00E | ZEUS | First generation |
| >161 | 95 | ¹⁴ ABREU 99G | DLPH | First generation |
| >200 | 95 | ¹⁵ ADLOFF 99 | H1 | First generation |
| | | ¹⁶ DERRICK 97 | ZEUS | Lepton-flavor violation |
| >168 | 95 | ¹⁷ DERRICK 93 | ZEUS | First generation |

¹ ABRAMOWICZ 12A limit is for a scalar, weak isoscalar, charge $-1/3$ leptoquark coupled with e_R . See their Figs. 12–17 and Table 4 for states with different quantum numbers.

² Limit from single production in Z decay. The limit is for a leptoquark coupling of electromagnetic strength and assumes $B(\ell q) = 2/3$. The limit is 77 GeV if first and second leptoquarks are degenerate.

³ AARON 11A search for various leptoquarks with lepton-flavor violating couplings. See their Figs. 2–3 and Tables 1–4 for detailed limits.

⁴ The quoted limit is for a scalar, weak isoscalar, charge $-1/3$ leptoquark coupled with e_R . See their Figs. 3–5 for limits on states with different quantum numbers.

⁵ ABAZOV 07E search for leptoquark single production through qg fusion process in $p\bar{p}$ collisions. See their Fig. 4 for exclusion plot in mass-coupling plane.

⁶ AKTAS 05B limit is for a scalar, weak isoscalar, charge $-1/3$ leptoquark coupled with e_R . See their Fig. 3 for limits on states with different quantum numbers.

⁷ CHEKANOV 05 search for various leptoquarks with lepton-flavor violating couplings. See their Figs. 6–10 and Tables 1–8 for detailed limits.

⁸ CHEKANOV 03B limit is for a scalar, weak isoscalar, charge $-1/3$ leptoquark coupled with e_R . See their Figs. 11–12 and Table 5 for limits on states with different quantum numbers.

⁹ For limits on states with different quantum numbers and the limits in the mass-coupling plane, see their Fig. 4 and Fig. 5.

¹⁰ CHEKANOV 02 search for various leptoquarks with lepton-flavor violating couplings. See their Figs. 6–7 and Tables 5–6 for detailed limits.

- ¹¹ For limits on states with different quantum numbers and the limits in the mass-coupling plane, see their Fig. 3.
- ¹² See their Fig. 14 for limits in the mass-coupling plane.
- ¹³ BREITWEG 00E search for $F=0$ leptoquarks in e^+p collisions. For limits in mass-coupling plane, see their Fig. 11.
- ¹⁴ ABREU 99G limit obtained from process $e\gamma \rightarrow LQ+q$. For limits on vector and scalar states with different quantum numbers and the limits in the coupling-mass plane, see their Fig. 4 and Table 2.
- ¹⁵ For limits on states with different quantum numbers and the limits in the mass-coupling plane, see their Fig. 13 and Fig. 14. ADLOFF 99 also search for leptoquarks with lepton-flavor violating couplings. ADLOFF 99 supersedes AID 96B.
- ¹⁶ DERRICK 97 search for various leptoquarks with lepton-flavor violating couplings. See their Figs. 5–8 and Table 1 for detailed limits.
- ¹⁷ DERRICK 93 search for single leptoquark production in ep collisions with the decay eq and νq . The limit is for leptoquark coupling of electromagnetic strength and assumes $B(eq) = B(\nu q) = 1/2$. The limit for $B(eq) = 1$ is 176 GeV. For limits on states with different quantum numbers, see their Table 3.

Indirect Limits for Leptoquarks

| VALUE (TeV) | CL% | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT | |
|---|-----|---------------|------|---------|---|
| ● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ● | | | | | |
| > 14 | 95 | 1 BESSAA | 15 | RVUE | $q\bar{q} \rightarrow e^+e^-$ |
| | | 2 SAHOO | 15A | RVUE | $B_{s,d} \rightarrow \mu^+\mu^-$ |
| | | 3 SAKAKI | 13 | RVUE | $B \rightarrow D^{(*)}\tau\bar{\nu}, B \rightarrow X_S\nu\bar{\nu}$ |
| > 2.5 | 95 | 4 KOSNIK | 12 | RVUE | $b \rightarrow s\ell^+\ell^-$ |
| | | 5 AARON | 11C | H1 | First generation |
| | | 6 DORSNER | 11 | RVUE | scalar, weak singlet, charge 4/3 |
| > 0.49 | 95 | 7 AKTAS | 07A | H1 | Lepton-flavor violation |
| | | 8 SCHAEEL | 07A | ALEP | $e^+e^- \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ |
| | | 9 SMIRNOV | 07 | RVUE | $K \rightarrow e\mu, B \rightarrow e\tau$ |
| > 1.7 | 96 | 10 CHEKANOV | 05A | ZEUS | Lepton-flavor violation |
| | | 11 ADLOFF | 03 | H1 | First generation |
| > 46 | 90 | 12 CHANG | 03 | BELL | Pati-Salam type |
| | | 13 CHEKANOV | 02 | ZEUS | Repl. by CHEKANOV 05A |
| > 1.7 | 95 | 14 CHEUNG | 01B | RVUE | First generation |
| > 0.39 | 95 | 15 ACCIARRI | 00P | L3 | $e^+e^- \rightarrow qq$ |
| > 1.5 | 95 | 16 ADLOFF | 00 | H1 | First generation |
| > 0.2 | 95 | 17 BARATE | 00i | ALEP | Repl. by SCHAEEL 07A |
| | | 18 BARGER | 00 | RVUE | Cs |
| > 0.74 | 95 | 19 GABRIELLI | 00 | RVUE | Lepton flavor violation |
| | | 20 ZARNECKI | 00 | RVUE | S_1 leptoquark |
| | | 21 ABBIENDI | 99 | OPAL | |
| > 19.3 | 95 | 22 ABE | 98V | CDF | $B_S \rightarrow e^\pm\mu^\mp$, Pati-Salam type |
| | | 23 ACCIARRI | 98J | L3 | $e^+e^- \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ |
| > 0.76 | 95 | 24 ACKERSTAFF | 98V | OPAL | $e^+e^- \rightarrow q\bar{q}, e^+e^- \rightarrow b\bar{b}$ |
| | | 25 DEANDREA | 97 | RVUE | \tilde{R}_2 leptoquark |
| | | 26 DERRICK | 97 | ZEUS | Lepton-flavor violation |
| | | 27 GROSSMAN | 97 | RVUE | $B \rightarrow \tau^+\tau^-(X)$ |
| | | 28 JADACH | 97 | RVUE | $e^+e^- \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ |

| | | | | | | |
|--------|----|----|-------------|-----|------|--|
| >1200 | | 29 | KUZNETSOV | 95B | RVUE | Pati-Salam type |
| | | 30 | MIZUKOSHI | 95 | RVUE | Third generation scalar leptoquark |
| > 0.3 | 95 | 31 | BHATTACH... | 94 | RVUE | Spin-0 leptoquark coupled to $\bar{e}_R t_L$ |
| | | 32 | DAVIDSON | 94 | RVUE | |
| > 18 | | 33 | KUZNETSOV | 94 | RVUE | Pati-Salam type |
| > 0.43 | 95 | 34 | LEURER | 94 | RVUE | First generation spin-1 leptoquark |
| > 0.44 | 95 | 34 | LEURER | 94B | RVUE | First generation spin-0 leptoquark |
| | | 35 | MAHANTA | 94 | RVUE | P and T violation |
| > 1 | | 36 | SHANKER | 82 | RVUE | Nonchiral spin-0 leptoquark |
| > 125 | | 36 | SHANKER | 82 | RVUE | Nonchiral spin-1 leptoquark |

¹ BESSAA 15 obtain limit on leptoquark induced four-fermion interactions from the ATLAS and CMS limit on the $\bar{q}q\bar{e}e$ contact interactions.

² SAHOO 15A obtain limit on leptoquark induced four-fermion interactions from $B_{s,d} \rightarrow \mu^+\mu^-$ for $\lambda \simeq O(1)$.

³ SAKAKI 13 explain the $B \rightarrow D^{(*)}\tau\bar{\nu}$ anomaly using Wilson coefficients of leptoquark-induced four-fermion operators.

⁴ KOSNIK 12 obtains limits on leptoquark induced four-fermion interactions from $b \rightarrow s\ell^+\ell^-$ decays.

⁵ AARON 11C limit is for weak isotriplet spin-0 leptoquark at strong coupling $\lambda = \sqrt{4\pi}$. For the limits of leptoquarks with different quantum numbers, see their Table 3. Limits are derived from bounds of eq contact interactions.

⁶ DORSNER 11 give bounds on scalar, weak singlet, charge 4/3 leptoquark from K, B, τ decays, meson mixings, $LFV, g-2$ and $Z \rightarrow b\bar{b}$.

⁷ AKTAS 07A search for lepton-flavor violation in ep collision. See their Tables 4–7 for limits on lepton-flavor violating four-fermion interactions induced by various leptoquarks.

⁸ SCHAEEL 07A limit is for the weak-isoscalar spin-0 left-handed leptoquark with the coupling of electromagnetic strength. For the limits of leptoquarks with different quantum numbers, see their Table 35.

⁹ SMIRNOV 07 obtains mass limits for the vector and scalar chiral leptoquark states from $K \rightarrow e\mu, B \rightarrow e\tau$ decays.

¹⁰ CHEKANOV 05 search for various leptoquarks with lepton-flavor violating couplings. See their Figs.6–10 and Tables 1–8 for detailed limits.

¹¹ ADLOFF 03 limit is for the weak isotriplet spin-0 leptoquark at strong coupling $\lambda = \sqrt{4\pi}$. For the limits of leptoquarks with different quantum numbers, see their Table 3. Limits are derived from bounds on $e^\pm q$ contact interactions.

¹² The bound is derived from $B(B^0 \rightarrow e^\pm\mu^\mp) < 1.7 \times 10^{-7}$.

¹³ CHEKANOV 02 search for lepton-flavor violation in ep collisions. See their Tables 1–4 for limits on lepton-flavor violating and four-fermion interactions induced by various leptoquarks.

¹⁴ CHEUNG 01B quoted limit is for a scalar, weak isoscalar, charge $-1/3$ leptoquark with a coupling of electromagnetic strength. The limit is derived from bounds on contact interactions in a global electroweak analysis. For the limits of leptoquarks with different quantum numbers, see Table 5.

¹⁵ ACCIARRI 00P limit is for the weak isoscalar spin-0 leptoquark with the coupling of electromagnetic strength. For the limits of leptoquarks with different quantum numbers, see their Table 4.

¹⁶ ADLOFF 00 limit is for the weak isotriplet spin-0 leptoquark at strong coupling, $\lambda = \sqrt{4\pi}$. For the limits of leptoquarks with different quantum numbers, see their Table 2. ADLOFF 00 limits are from the Q^2 spectrum measurement of $e^+p \rightarrow e^+X$.

¹⁷ BARATE 00I search for deviations in cross section and jet-charge asymmetry in $e^+e^- \rightarrow \bar{q}q$ due to t -channel exchange of a leptoquark at $\sqrt{s}=130$ to 183 GeV. Limits for other scalar and vector leptoquarks are also given in their Table 22.

¹⁸ BARGER 00 explain the deviation of atomic parity violation in cesium atoms from prediction is explained by scalar leptoquark exchange.

- 19 GABRIELLI 00 calculate various process with lepton flavor violation in leptoquark models.
- 20 ZARNECKI 00 limit is derived from data of HERA, LEP, and Tevatron and from various low-energy data including atomic parity violation. Leptoquark coupling with electromagnetic strength is assumed.
- 21 ABBIENDI 99 limits are from $e^+ e^- \rightarrow q \bar{q}$ cross section at 130–136, 161–172, 183 GeV. See their Fig. 8 and Fig. 9 for limits in mass-coupling plane.
- 22 ABE 98V quoted limit is from $B(B_s \rightarrow e^\pm \mu^\mp) < 8.2 \times 10^{-6}$. ABE 98V also obtain a similar limit on $M_{LQ} > 20.4$ TeV from $B(B_d \rightarrow e^\pm \mu^\mp) < 4.5 \times 10^{-6}$. Both bounds assume the non-canonical association of the b quark with electrons or muons under SU(4).
- 23 ACCIARRI 98J limit is from $e^+ e^- \rightarrow q \bar{q}$ cross section at $\sqrt{s}=130$ –172 GeV which can be affected by the t - and u -channel exchanges of leptoquarks. See their Fig. 4 and Fig. 5 for limits in the mass-coupling plane.
- 24 ACKERSTAFF 98V limits are from $e^+ e^- \rightarrow q \bar{q}$ and $e^+ e^- \rightarrow b \bar{b}$ cross sections at $\sqrt{s} = 130$ –172 GeV, which can be affected by the t - and u -channel exchanges of leptoquarks. See their Fig. 21 and Fig. 22 for limits of leptoquarks in mass-coupling plane.
- 25 DEANDREA 97 limit is for \tilde{R}_2 leptoquark obtained from atomic parity violation (APV). The coupling of leptoquark is assumed to be electromagnetic strength. See Table 2 for limits of the four-fermion interactions induced by various scalar leptoquark exchange. DEANDREA 97 combines APV limit and limits from Tevatron and HERA. See Fig. 1–4 for combined limits of leptoquark in mass-coupling plane.
- 26 DERRICK 97 search for lepton-flavor violation in $e p$ collision. See their Tables 2–5 for limits on lepton-flavor violating four-fermion interactions induced by various leptoquarks.
- 27 GROSSMAN 97 estimate the upper bounds on the branching fraction $B \rightarrow \tau^\pm \tau^\mp (X)$ from the absence of the B decay with large missing energy. These bounds can be used to constrain leptoquark induced four-fermion interactions.
- 28 JADACH 97 limit is from $e^+ e^- \rightarrow q \bar{q}$ cross section at $\sqrt{s}=172.3$ GeV which can be affected by the t - and u -channel exchanges of leptoquarks. See their Fig. 1 for limits on vector leptoquarks in mass-coupling plane.
- 29 KUZNETSOV 95B use π , K , B , τ decays and μe conversion and give a list of bounds on the leptoquark mass and the fermion mixing matrix in the Pati-Salam model. The quoted limit is from $K_L \rightarrow \mu e$ decay assuming zero mixing.
- 30 MIZUKOSHI 95 calculate the one-loop radiative correction to the Z -physics parameters in various scalar leptoquark models. See their Fig. 4 for the exclusion plot of third generation leptoquark models in mass-coupling plane.
- 31 BHATTACHARYYA 94 limit is from one-loop radiative correction to the leptonic decay width of the Z . $m_H=250$ GeV, $\alpha_s(m_Z)=0.12$, $m_t=180$ GeV, and the electroweak strength of leptoquark coupling are assumed. For leptoquark coupled to $\bar{e}_L t_R$, $\bar{\mu} t$, and $\bar{\tau} t$, see Fig. 2 in BHATTACHARYYA 94B erratum and Fig. 3.
- 32 DAVIDSON 94 gives an extensive list of the bounds on leptoquark-induced four-fermion interactions from π , K , D , B , μ , τ decays and meson mixings, *etc.* See Table 15 of DAVIDSON 94 for detail.
- 33 KUZNETSOV 94 gives mixing independent bound of the Pati-Salam leptoquark from the cosmological limit on $\pi^0 \rightarrow \bar{\nu} \nu$.
- 34 LEURER 94, LEURER 94B limits are obtained from atomic parity violation and apply to any chiral leptoquark which couples to the first generation with electromagnetic strength. For a nonchiral leptoquark, universality in $\pi_{\ell 2}$ decay provides a much more stringent bound.
- 35 MAHANTA 94 gives bounds of P - and T -violating scalar-leptoquark couplings from atomic and molecular experiments.
- 36 From $(\pi \rightarrow e \nu)/(\pi \rightarrow \mu \nu)$ ratio. SHANKER 82 assumes the leptoquark induced four-fermion coupling $4g^2/M^2 (\bar{\nu}_{eL} u_R) (\bar{d}_L e_R)$ with $g=0.004$ for spin-0 leptoquark and $g^2/M^2 (\bar{\nu}_{eL} \gamma_\mu u_L) (\bar{d}_R \gamma^\mu e_R)$ with $g \simeq 0.6$ for spin-1 leptoquark.

MASS LIMITS for Diquarks

| VALUE (GeV) | CL% | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|---|-----|------------------------------|----------|--------------------------------|
| >4700 (CL = 95%) OUR LIMIT | | | | |
| none 1200–4700 | 95 | ¹ KHACHATRY...15V | CMS | E_6 diquark |
| • • • We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. • • • | | | | |
| >3750 | 95 | ² CHATRCHYAN 13A | CMS | E_6 diquark |
| none 1000–4280 | 95 | ³ CHATRCHYAN 13AS | CMS | Superseded by KHACHA-TRYAN 15V |
| >3520 | 95 | ⁴ CHATRCHYAN 11Y | CMS | Superseded by CHATRCHYAN 13A |
| none 970–1080, 1450–1600 | 95 | ⁵ KHACHATRY...10 | CMS | Superseded by CHATRCHYAN 13A |
| none 290–630 | 95 | ⁶ AALTONEN | 09AC CDF | E_6 diquark |
| none 290–420 | 95 | ⁷ ABE | 97G CDF | E_6 diquark |
| none 15–31.7 | 95 | ⁸ ABREU | 940 DLPH | SUSY E_6 diquark |

¹ KHACHATRYAN 15V search for resonances decaying to dijets in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV.

² CHATRCHYAN 13A search for new resonance decaying to dijets in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV.

³ CHATRCHYAN 13AS search for new resonance decaying to dijets in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV.

⁴ CHATRCHYAN 11Y search for new resonance decaying to dijets in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV.

⁵ KHACHATRYAN 10 search for new resonance decaying to dijets in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV.

⁶ AALTONEN 09AC search for new narrow resonance decaying to dijets.

⁷ ABE 97G search for new particle decaying to dijets.

⁸ ABREU 940 limit is from $e^+e^- \rightarrow \bar{c}sc$. Range extends up to 43 GeV if diquarks are degenerate in mass.

MASS LIMITS for g_A (axigluon) and Other Color-Octet Gauge Bosons

Axigluons are massive color-octet gauge bosons in chiral color models and have axial-vector coupling to quarks with the same coupling strength as gluons.

| VALUE (GeV) | CL% | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|---|-----|-------------------------------|------|---|
| >3600 (CL = 95%) OUR LIMIT | | | | |
| none 1300–3600 | 95 | ¹ KHACHATRY...15V | CMS | $pp \rightarrow g_A X, g_A \rightarrow 2j$ |
| • • • We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. • • • | | | | |
| >2800 | 95 | ² KHACHATRY...16E | CMS | $pp \rightarrow g_{KK} X, g_{KK} \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |
| | | ³ KHACHATRY...15AV | CMS | $pp \rightarrow \theta^0 \theta^0 \rightarrow b\bar{b}Zg$ |
| | | ⁴ AALTONEN 13R | CDF | $p\bar{p} \rightarrow g_A X, g_A \rightarrow \sigma\sigma, \sigma \rightarrow 2j$ |
| >3360 | 95 | ⁵ CHATRCHYAN 13A | CMS | $pp \rightarrow g_A X, g_A \rightarrow 2j$ |
| none 1000–3270 | 95 | ⁶ CHATRCHYAN 13AS | CMS | Superseded by KHACHA-TRYAN 15V |
| none 250–740 | 95 | ⁷ CHATRCHYAN 13AU | CMS | $pp \rightarrow 2g_A X, g_A \rightarrow 2j$ |
| > 775 | 95 | ⁸ ABAZOV 12R | D0 | $p\bar{p} \rightarrow g_A X, g_A \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |
| >2470 | 95 | ⁹ CHATRCHYAN 11Y | CMS | Superseded by CHATRCHYAN 13A |
| | | ¹⁰ AALTONEN 10L | CDF | $p\bar{p} \rightarrow g_A X, g_A \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ |
| none 1470–1520 | 95 | ¹¹ KHACHATRY...10 | CMS | Superseded by CHATRCHYAN 13A |
| none 260–1250 | 95 | ¹² AALTONEN 09AC | CDF | $p\bar{p} \rightarrow g_A X, g_A \rightarrow 2j$ |

| | | | | | |
|--------------|----|----|---------------|------|--|
| > 910 | 95 | 13 | CHOUDHURY 07 | RVUE | $p\bar{p} \rightarrow t\bar{t}X$ |
| > 365 | 95 | 14 | DONCHESKI 98 | RVUE | $\Gamma(Z \rightarrow \text{hadron})$ |
| none 200–980 | 95 | 15 | ABE 97G | CDF | $p\bar{p} \rightarrow g_A X, g_A \rightarrow 2j$ |
| none 200–870 | 95 | 16 | ABE 95N | CDF | $p\bar{p} \rightarrow g_A X, g_A \rightarrow q\bar{q}$ |
| none 240–640 | 95 | 17 | ABE 93G | CDF | $p\bar{p} \rightarrow g_A X, g_A \rightarrow 2j$ |
| > 50 | 95 | 18 | CUYPERS 91 | RVUE | $\sigma(e^+e^- \rightarrow \text{hadrons})$ |
| none 120–210 | 95 | 19 | ABE 90H | CDF | $p\bar{p} \rightarrow g_A X, g_A \rightarrow 2j$ |
| > 29 | | 20 | ROBINETT 89 | THEO | Partial-wave unitarity |
| none 150–310 | 95 | 21 | ALBAJAR 88B | UA1 | $p\bar{p} \rightarrow g_A X, g_A \rightarrow 2j$ |
| > 20 | | | BERGSTROM 88 | RVUE | $p\bar{p} \rightarrow \gamma X$ via $g_A g$ |
| > 9 | | 22 | CUYPERS 88 | RVUE | γ decay |
| > 25 | | 23 | DONCHESKI 88B | RVUE | γ decay |

¹ KHACHATRYAN 15V search for resonances decaying to dijets in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV.

² KHACHATRYAN 16E search for KK gluon decaying to $t\bar{t}$ in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV.

³ KHACHATRYAN 15AV search for pair productions of neutral color-octet weak-triplet scalar particles (Θ^0), decaying to $b\bar{b}$, Zg or γg , in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV. The Θ^0 particle is often predicted in coloron (G' , color-octet gauge boson) models and appear in the pp collisions through $G' \rightarrow \Theta^0 \Theta^0$ decays. Assuming $B(\Theta^0 \rightarrow b\bar{b}) = 0.5$, they give limits $m_{\Theta^0} > 623$ GeV (426 GeV) for $m_{G'} = 2.3 m_{\Theta^0}$ ($m_{G'} = 5 m_{\Theta^0}$).

⁴ AALTONEN 13R search for new resonance decaying to $\sigma\sigma$, with hypothetical strongly interacting σ particle subsequently decaying to 2 jets, in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV, using data corresponding to an integrated luminosity of 6.6 fb^{-1} . For $50 \text{ GeV} < m_\sigma < m_{g_A}/2$, axigluons in mass range 150–400 GeV are excluded.

⁵ CHATRCHYAN 13A search for new resonance decaying to dijets in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV.

⁶ CHATRCHYAN 13AS search for new resonance decaying to dijets in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV.

⁷ CHATRCHYAN 13AU search for the pair produced color-octet vector bosons decaying to $q\bar{q}$ pairs in pp collisions. The quoted limit is for $B(g_A \rightarrow q\bar{q}) = 1$.

⁸ ABAZOV 12R search for massive color octet vector particle decaying to $t\bar{t}$. The quoted limit assumes g_A couplings with light quarks are suppressed by 0.2.

⁹ CHATRCHYAN 11Y search for new resonance decaying to dijets in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV.

¹⁰ AALTONEN 10L search for massive color octet non-chiral vector particle decaying into $t\bar{t}$ pair with mass in the range $400 \text{ GeV} < M < 800 \text{ GeV}$. See their Fig. 6 for limit in the mass-coupling plane.

¹¹ KHACHATRYAN 10 search for new resonance decaying to dijets in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV.

¹² AALTONEN 09AC search for new narrow resonance decaying to dijets.

¹³ CHOUDHURY 07 limit is from the $t\bar{t}$ production cross section measured at CDF.

¹⁴ DONCHESKI 98 compare α_s derived from low-energy data and that from $\Gamma(Z \rightarrow \text{hadrons})/\Gamma(Z \rightarrow \text{leptons})$.

¹⁵ ABE 97G search for new particle decaying to dijets.

¹⁶ ABE 95N assume axigluons decaying to quarks in the Standard Model only.

¹⁷ ABE 93G assume $\Gamma(g_A) = N\alpha_s m_{g_A}/6$ with $N = 10$.

¹⁸ CUYPERS 91 compare α_s measured in γ decay and that from R at PEP/PETRA energies.

¹⁹ ABE 90H assumes $\Gamma(g_A) = N\alpha_s m_{g_A}/6$ with $N = 5$ ($\Gamma(g_A) = 0.09 m_{g_A}$). For $N = 10$, the excluded region is reduced to 120–150 GeV.

- ²⁰ ROBINETT 89 result demands partial-wave unitarity of $J = 0$ $t\bar{t} \rightarrow t\bar{t}$ scattering amplitude and derives a limit $m_{g_A} > 0.5 m_t$. Assumes $m_t > 56$ GeV.
- ²¹ ALBAJAR 88B result is from the nonobservation of a peak in two-jet invariant mass distribution. $\Gamma(g_A) < 0.4 m_{g_A}$ assumed. See also BAGGER 88.
- ²² CUYPERS 88 requires $\Gamma(\Upsilon \rightarrow g g_A) < \Gamma(\Upsilon \rightarrow g g g)$. A similar result is obtained by DONCHESKI 88.
- ²³ DONCHESKI 88B requires $\Gamma(\Upsilon \rightarrow g q\bar{q})/\Gamma(\Upsilon \rightarrow g g g) < 0.25$, where the former decay proceeds via axigluon exchange. A more conservative estimate of < 0.5 leads to $m_{g_A} > 21$ GeV.

MASS LIMITS for Color-Octet Scalar Bosons

| VALUE (GeV) | CL% | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|-------------|-----|-------------|------|---------|
|-------------|-----|-------------|------|---------|

• • • We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. • • •

| | | | | |
|--------------|----|-----------------------------------|----------|---|
| none 150–287 | 95 | ¹ KHACHATRY...15AV CMS | 13K ATLS | $pp \rightarrow \Theta^0 \Theta^0 \rightarrow b\bar{b} Z g$ |
| | | ² AAD | | $pp \rightarrow S_8 S_8 X, S_8 \rightarrow 2$ jets |

¹ KHACHATRYAN 15AV search for pair productions of neutral color-octet weak-triplet scalar particles (Θ^0), decaying to $b\bar{b}$, Zg or γg , in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 8$ TeV. The Θ^0 particle is often predicted in coloron (G' , color-octet gauge boson) models and appear in the pp collisions through $G' \rightarrow \Theta^0 \Theta^0$ decays. Assuming $B(\Theta^0 \rightarrow b\bar{b}) = 0.5$, they give limits $m_{\Theta^0} > 623$ GeV (426 GeV) for $m_{G'} = 2.3 m_{\Theta^0}$ ($m_{G'} = 5 m_{\Theta^0}$).

² AAD 13K search for pair production of color-octet scalar particles in pp collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 7$ TeV. Cross section limits are interpreted as mass limits on scalar partners of a Dirac gluino.

X^0 (Heavy Boson) Searches in Z Decays

Searches for radiative transition of Z to a lighter spin-0 state X^0 decaying to hadrons, a lepton pair, a photon pair, or invisible particles as shown in the comments. The limits are for the product of branching ratios.

| VALUE | CL% | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|-------|-----|-------------|------|---------|
|-------|-----|-------------|------|---------|

• • • We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. • • •

| | | | | |
|-------------------------|----|-----------------------|----------|--|
| <1.1 × 10 ⁻⁴ | 95 | ¹ BARATE | 98U ALEP | $X^0 \rightarrow \ell\bar{\ell}, q\bar{q}, gg, \gamma\gamma, \nu\bar{\nu}$ |
| | | ² ACCIARRI | 97Q L3 | $X^0 \rightarrow$ invisible particle(s) |
| | | ³ ACTON | 93E OPAL | $X^0 \rightarrow \gamma\gamma$ |
| | | ⁴ ABREU | 92D DLPH | $X^0 \rightarrow$ hadrons |
| | | ⁵ ADRIANI | 92F L3 | $X^0 \rightarrow$ hadrons |
| | | ⁶ ACTON | 91 OPAL | $X^0 \rightarrow$ anything |
| | | ⁷ ACTON | 91B OPAL | $X^0 \rightarrow e^+ e^-$ |
| | | ⁷ ACTON | 91B OPAL | $X^0 \rightarrow \mu^+ \mu^-$ |
| | | ⁷ ACTON | 91B OPAL | $X^0 \rightarrow \tau^+ \tau^-$ |
| | | ⁸ ADEVA | 91D L3 | $X^0 \rightarrow e^+ e^-$ |
| <9 × 10 ⁻⁵ | 95 | ⁷ ACTON | 91B OPAL | $X^0 \rightarrow \mu^+ \mu^-$ |
| <1.1 × 10 ⁻⁴ | 95 | ⁷ ACTON | 91B OPAL | $X^0 \rightarrow \tau^+ \tau^-$ |
| <2.8 × 10 ⁻⁴ | 95 | ⁸ ADEVA | 91D L3 | $X^0 \rightarrow e^+ e^-$ |
| <2.3 × 10 ⁻⁴ | 95 | ⁸ ADEVA | 91D L3 | $X^0 \rightarrow \mu^+ \mu^-$ |
| <4.7 × 10 ⁻⁴ | 95 | ⁹ ADEVA | 91D L3 | $X^0 \rightarrow$ hadrons |
| <8 × 10 ⁻⁴ | 95 | ¹⁰ AKRAWY | 90J OPAL | $X^0 \rightarrow$ hadrons |

¹ BARATE 98U obtain limits on $B(Z \rightarrow \gamma X^0)B(X^0 \rightarrow \ell\bar{\ell}, q\bar{q}, gg, \gamma\gamma, \nu\bar{\nu})$. See their Fig. 17.

² See Fig. 4 of ACCIARRI 97Q for the upper limit on $B(Z \rightarrow \gamma X^0; E_\gamma > E_{\min})$ as a function of E_{\min} .

- ³ ACTON 93E give $\sigma(e^+e^- \rightarrow X^0\gamma) \cdot B(X^0 \rightarrow \gamma\gamma) < 0.4$ pb (95%CL) for $m_{X^0} = 60 \pm 2.5$ GeV. If the process occurs via s -channel γ exchange, the limit translates to $\Gamma(X^0) \cdot B(X^0 \rightarrow \gamma\gamma)^2 < 20$ MeV for $m_{X^0} = 60 \pm 1$ GeV.
- ⁴ ABREU 92D give $\sigma_Z \cdot B(Z \rightarrow \gamma X^0) \cdot B(X^0 \rightarrow \text{hadrons}) < (3-10)$ pb for $m_{X^0} = 10-78$ GeV. A very similar limit is obtained for spin-1 X^0 .
- ⁵ ADRIANI 92F search for isolated γ in hadronic Z decays. The limit $\sigma_Z \cdot B(Z \rightarrow \gamma X^0) \cdot B(X^0 \rightarrow \text{hadrons}) < (2-10)$ pb (95%CL) is given for $m_{X^0} = 25-85$ GeV.
- ⁶ ACTON 91 searches for $Z \rightarrow Z^* X^0$, $Z^* \rightarrow e^+e^-$, $\mu^+\mu^-$, or $\nu\bar{\nu}$. Excludes any new scalar X^0 with $m_{X^0} < 9.5$ GeV/ c if it has the same coupling to $Z Z^*$ as the MSM Higgs boson.
- ⁷ ACTON 91B limits are for $m_{X^0} = 60-85$ GeV.
- ⁸ ADEVA 91D limits are for $m_{X^0} = 30-89$ GeV.
- ⁹ ADEVA 91D limits are for $m_{X^0} = 30-86$ GeV.
- ¹⁰ AKRAWY 90J give $\Gamma(Z \rightarrow \gamma X^0) \cdot B(X^0 \rightarrow \text{hadrons}) < 1.9$ MeV (95%CL) for $m_{X^0} = 32-80$ GeV. We divide by $\Gamma(Z) = 2.5$ GeV to get product of branching ratios. For nonresonant transitions, the limit is $B(Z \rightarrow \gamma q\bar{q}) < 8.2$ MeV assuming three-body phase space distribution.

MASS LIMITS for a Heavy Neutral Boson Coupling to e^+e^-

| VALUE (GeV) | CL% | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|---|-----|----------------------|----------|---|
| ● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ● | | | | |
| none 55-61 | | ¹ ODAKA | 89 VNS | $\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+e^-) \cdot B(X^0 \rightarrow \text{had.}) \gtrsim 0.2$ MeV |
| >45 | 95 | ² DERRICK | 86 HRS | $\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+e^-) = 6$ MeV |
| >46.6 | 95 | ³ ADEVA | 85 MRKJ | $\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+e^-) = 10$ keV |
| >48 | 95 | ³ ADEVA | 85 MRKJ | $\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+e^-) = 4$ MeV |
| | | ⁴ BERGER | 85B PLUT | |
| none 39.8-45.5 | | ⁵ ADEVA | 84 MRKJ | $\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+e^-) = 10$ keV |
| >47.8 | 95 | ⁵ ADEVA | 84 MRKJ | $\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+e^-) = 4$ MeV |
| none 39.8-45.2 | | ⁵ BEHREND | 84C CELL | |
| >47 | 95 | ⁵ BEHREND | 84C CELL | $\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+e^-) = 4$ MeV |

¹ ODAKA 89 looked for a narrow or wide scalar resonance in $e^+e^- \rightarrow \text{hadrons}$ at $E_{\text{cm}} = 55.0-60.8$ GeV.

² DERRICK 86 found no deviation from the Standard Model Bhabha scattering at $E_{\text{cm}} = 29$ GeV and set limits on the possible scalar boson e^+e^- coupling. See their figure 4 for excluded region in the $\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+e^-) - m_{X^0}$ plane. Electronic chiral invariance requires a parity doublet of X^0 , in which case the limit applies for $\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+e^-) = 3$ MeV.

³ ADEVA 85 first limit is from 2γ , $\mu^+\mu^-$, hadrons assuming X^0 is a scalar. Second limit is from e^+e^- channel. $E_{\text{cm}} = 40-47$ GeV. Supersedes ADEVA 84.

⁴ BERGER 85B looked for effect of spin-0 boson exchange in $e^+e^- \rightarrow e^+e^-$ and $\mu^+\mu^-$ at $E_{\text{cm}} = 34.7$ GeV. See Fig. 5 for excluded region in the $m_{X^0} - \Gamma(X^0)$ plane.

⁵ ADEVA 84 and BEHREND 84C have $E_{\text{cm}} = 39.8-45.5$ GeV. MARK-J searched X^0 in $e^+e^- \rightarrow \text{hadrons}$, 2γ , $\mu^+\mu^-$, e^+e^- and CELLO in the same channels plus τ pair. No narrow or broad X^0 is found in the energy range. They also searched for the effect of X^0 with $m_X > E_{\text{cm}}$. The second limits are from Bhabha data and for spin-0 singlet.

The same limits apply for $\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+e^-) = 2$ MeV if X^0 is a spin-0 doublet. The second limit of BEHREND 84C was read off from their figure 2. The original papers also list limits in other channels.

Search for X^0 Resonance in e^+e^- Collisions

The limit is for $\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+e^-) \cdot B(X^0 \rightarrow f)$, where f is the specified final state.

Spin 0 is assumed for X^0 .

| VALUE (keV) | CL% | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|---|-----|----------------------|----------|----------------------|
| • • • We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. • • • | | | | |
| $<10^3$ | 95 | ¹ ABE | 93C VNS | $\Gamma(ee)$ |
| $<(0.4-10)$ | 95 | ² ABE | 93C VNS | $f = \gamma\gamma$ |
| $<(0.3-5)$ | 95 | ^{3,4} ABE | 93D TOPZ | $f = \gamma\gamma$ |
| $<(2-12)$ | 95 | ^{3,4} ABE | 93D TOPZ | $f = \text{hadrons}$ |
| $<(4-200)$ | 95 | ^{4,5} ABE | 93D TOPZ | $f = ee$ |
| $<(0.1-6)$ | 95 | ^{4,5} ABE | 93D TOPZ | $f = \mu\mu$ |
| $<(0.5-8)$ | 90 | ⁶ STERNER | 93 AMY | $f = \gamma\gamma$ |

¹ Limit is for $\Gamma(X^0 \rightarrow e^+e^-) m_{X^0} = 56-63.5$ GeV for $\Gamma(X^0) = 0.5$ GeV.

² Limit is for $m_{X^0} = 56-61.5$ GeV and is valid for $\Gamma(X^0) \ll 100$ MeV. See their Fig. 5 for limits for $\Gamma = 1, 2$ GeV.

³ Limit is for $m_{X^0} = 57.2-60$ GeV.

⁴ Limit is valid for $\Gamma(X^0) \ll 100$ MeV. See paper for limits for $\Gamma = 1$ GeV and those for $J = 2$ resonances.

⁵ Limit is for $m_{X^0} = 56.6-60$ GeV.

⁶ STERNER 93 limit is for $m_{X^0} = 57-59.6$ GeV and is valid for $\Gamma(X^0) < 100$ MeV. See their Fig. 2 for limits for $\Gamma = 1, 3$ GeV.

Search for X^0 Resonance in ep Collisions

| VALUE | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|-------|-------------|------|---------|
|-------|-------------|------|---------|

• • • We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. • • •

¹ CHEKANOV 02B ZEUS $X \rightarrow jj$

¹ CHEKANOV 02B search for photoproduction of X decaying into dijets in ep collisions. See their Fig. 5 for the limit on the photoproduction cross section.

Search for X^0 Resonance in $e^+e^- \rightarrow X^0\gamma$

| VALUE (GeV) | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|-------------|-------------|------|---------|
|-------------|-------------|------|---------|

• • • We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. • • •

¹ ABBIENDI 03D OPAL $X^0 \rightarrow \gamma\gamma$

² ABREU 00Z DLPH X^0 decaying invisibly

³ ADAM 96C DLPH X^0 decaying invisibly

¹ ABBIENDI 03D measure the $e^+e^- \rightarrow \gamma\gamma\gamma$ cross section at $\sqrt{s}=181-209$ GeV. The upper bound on the production cross section, $\sigma(e^+e^- \rightarrow X^0\gamma)$ times the branching ratio for $X^0 \rightarrow \gamma\gamma$, is less than 0.03 pb at 95%CL for X^0 masses between 20 and 180 GeV. See their Fig. 9b for the limits in the mass-cross section plane.

² ABREU 00Z is from the single photon cross section at $\sqrt{s}=183, 189$ GeV. The production cross section upper limit is less than 0.3 pb for X^0 mass between 40 and 160 GeV. See their Fig. 4 for the limit in mass-cross section plane.

³ ADAM 96C is from the single photon production cross at $\sqrt{s}=130, 136$ GeV. The upper bound is less than 3 pb for X^0 masses between 60 and 130 GeV. See their Fig. 5 for the exact bound on the cross section $\sigma(e^+e^- \rightarrow \gamma X^0)$.

Search for X^0 Resonance in $Z \rightarrow f\bar{f}X^0$

The limit is for $B(Z \rightarrow f\bar{f}X^0) \cdot B(X^0 \rightarrow F)$ where f is a fermion and F is the specified final state. Spin 0 is assumed for X^0 .

| VALUE | CL% | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|---|-----|--|------|---------|
| ● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ● | | | | |
| $<3.7 \times 10^{-6}$ | 95 | ¹ ABREU 96T DLPH $f=e,\mu,\tau; F=\gamma\gamma$ | | |
| | | ² ABREU 96T DLPH $f=\nu; F=\gamma\gamma$ | | |
| | | ³ ABREU 96T DLPH $f=q; F=\gamma\gamma$ | | |
| $<6.8 \times 10^{-6}$ | 95 | ² ACTON 93E OPAL $f=e,\mu,\tau; F=\gamma\gamma$ | | |
| $<5.5 \times 10^{-6}$ | 95 | ² ACTON 93E OPAL $f=q; F=\gamma\gamma$ | | |
| $<3.1 \times 10^{-6}$ | 95 | ² ACTON 93E OPAL $f=\nu; F=\gamma\gamma$ | | |
| $<6.5 \times 10^{-6}$ | 95 | ² ACTON 93E OPAL $f=e,\mu; F=\ell\bar{\ell}, q\bar{q}, \nu\bar{\nu}$ | | |
| $<7.1 \times 10^{-6}$ | 95 | ² BUSKULIC 93F ALEP $f=e,\mu; F=\ell\bar{\ell}, q\bar{q}, \nu\bar{\nu}$ | | |
| | | ⁴ ADRIANI 92F L3 $f=q; F=\gamma\gamma$ | | |

¹ ABREU 96T obtain limit as a function of m_{X^0} . See their Fig. 6.

² Limit is for m_{X^0} around 60 GeV.

³ ABREU 96T obtain limit as a function of m_{X^0} . See their Fig. 15.

⁴ ADRIANI 92F give $\sigma_Z \cdot B(Z \rightarrow q\bar{q}X^0) \cdot B(X^0 \rightarrow \gamma\gamma) < (0.75-1.5)$ pb (95%CL) for $m_{X^0} = 10-70$ GeV. The limit is 1 pb at 60 GeV.

Search for X^0 Resonance in WX^0 final state

| VALUE (MeV) | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|---|----------------------------------|------|----------------------------|
| ● ● ● We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. ● ● ● | | | |
| | ¹ AALTONEN 13AA CDF | | $X^0 \rightarrow jj$ |
| | ² CHATRCHYAN 12BR CMS | | $X^0 \rightarrow jj$ |
| | ³ ABAZOV 11I D0 | | $X^0 \rightarrow jj$ |
| | ⁴ ABE 97W CDF | | $X^0 \rightarrow b\bar{b}$ |

¹ AALTONEN 13AA search for X^0 production associated with W (or Z) in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.96$ TeV. The upper limit on the cross section $\sigma(p\bar{p} \rightarrow WX^0)$ is 2.2 pb for $M_{X^0} = 145$ GeV.

² CHATRCHYAN 12BR search for X^0 production associated with W in pp collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 7$ TeV. The upper limit on the cross section is 5.0 pb at 95% CL for $m_{X^0} = 150$ GeV.

³ ABAZOV 11I search for X^0 production associated with W in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}} = 1.96$ TeV. The 95% CL upper limit on the cross section ranges from 2.57 to 1.28 pb for X^0 mass between 110 and 170 GeV.

⁴ ABE 97W search for X^0 production associated with W in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $E_{\text{cm}}=1.8$ TeV. The 95%CL upper limit on the production cross section times the branching ratio for $X^0 \rightarrow b\bar{b}$ ranges from 14 to 19 pb for X^0 mass between 70 and 120 GeV. See their Fig. 3 for upper limits of the production cross section as a function of m_{X^0} .

Search for X^0 Resonance in Quarkonium DecaysLimits are for branching ratios to modes shown. Spin 1 is assumed for X^0 .

| VALUE | CL% | DOCUMENT ID | TECN | COMMENT |
|-------|-----|-------------|------|---------|
|-------|-----|-------------|------|---------|

• • • We do not use the following data for averages, fits, limits, etc. • • •

| | | | | |
|---|----|---------------------|----|---|
| $< 3 \times 10^{-5}$ – 6×10^{-3} | 90 | ¹ BALEST | 95 | CLE2 $\Upsilon(1S) \rightarrow X^0 \bar{X}^0 \gamma$, $m_{X^0} < 3.9$ GeV |
|---|----|---------------------|----|---|

¹BALEST 95 three-body limit is for phase-space photon energy distribution and angular distribution same as for $\Upsilon \rightarrow gg\gamma$.**REFERENCES FOR Searches for New Heavy Bosons (W' , Z' , leptoquarks, etc.)**

| | | | | |
|--------------|------|-------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------|
| AAD | 16G | EPJ C76 5 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| KHACHATRY... | 16E | PR D93 012001 | V. Khachatryan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| AAD | 15AM | JHEP 1507 157 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 15AO | JHEP 1508 148 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 15AT | EPJ C75 79 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 15AU | EPJ C75 69 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 15AV | EPJ C75 165 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 15AZ | EPJ C75 209 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 15BB | EPJ C75 263 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 15CD | PR D92 092001 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 15CP | JHEP 1512 055 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 15O | PRL 115 031801 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 15R | PL B743 235 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 15V | PR D91 052007 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AALTONEN | 15C | PRL 115 061801 | T. Aaltonen <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| BESSAA | 15 | EPJ C75 97 | A. Bessaa, S. Davidson | |
| KHACHATRY... | 15AE | JHEP 1504 025 | V. Khachatryan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| KHACHATRY... | 15AJ | JHEP 1507 042 | V. Khachatryan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| KHACHATRY... | 15AV | JHEP 1509 201 | V. Khachatryan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| KHACHATRY... | 15C | PL B740 83 | V. Khachatryan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| KHACHATRY... | 15F | PRL 114 101801 | V. Khachatryan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| KHACHATRY... | 15O | PL B748 255 | V. Khachatryan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| KHACHATRY... | 15T | PR D91 092005 | V. Khachatryan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| KHACHATRY... | 15V | PR D91 052009 | V. Khachatryan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| SAHOO | 15A | PR D91 094019 | S. Sahoo, R. Mohanta | |
| AAD | 14AI | JHEP 1409 037 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 14AT | PL B738 428 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 14S | PL B737 223 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 14V | PR D90 052005 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| KHACHATRY... | 14 | JHEP 1408 173 | V. Khachatryan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| KHACHATRY... | 14A | JHEP 1408 174 | V. Khachatryan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| KHACHATRY... | 14O | EPJ C74 3149 | V. Khachatryan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| KHACHATRY... | 14T | PL B739 229 | V. Khachatryan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| MARTINEZ | 14 | PR D90 015028 | R. Martinez, F. Ochoa | |
| PRIEELS | 14 | PR D90 112003 | R. Prieels <i>et al.</i> | (LOUV, ETH, PSI+) |
| AAD | 13AE | JHEP 1306 033 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 13AI | PL B723 15 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 13AO | PR D87 112006 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 13AQ | PR D88 012004 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 13D | JHEP 1301 029 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 13G | JHEP 1301 116 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 13K | EPJ C73 2263 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 13S | PL B719 242 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AALTONEN | 13A | PRL 110 121802 | T. Aaltonen <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| AALTONEN | 13AA | PR D88 092004 | T. Aaltonen <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| AALTONEN | 13R | PRL 111 031802 | T. Aaltonen <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 13A | JHEP 1301 013 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 13AF | PL B720 63 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 13AJ | PL B723 280 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 13AP | PR D87 072002 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 13AQ | PR D87 072005 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 13AS | PR D87 114015 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 13AU | PRL 110 141802 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 13BM | PRL 111 211804 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| Also | | PRL 112 119903 (errata) | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |

| | | | | |
|-------------|------|-------------------------|--|-----------------|
| CHATRCHYAN | 13E | PL B718 1229 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 13M | PRL 110 081801 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 13U | JHEP 1302 036 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| SAKAKI | 13 | PR D88 094012 | Y. Sakaki <i>et al.</i> | |
| AAD | 12AV | PRL 109 081801 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 12BB | PR D85 112012 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 12BV | JHEP 1209 041 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 12CC | JHEP 1211 138 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 12CK | PR D86 091103 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 12CR | EPJ C72 2241 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 12H | PL B709 158 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| Also | | PL B711 442 (errata.) | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 12K | EPJ C72 2083 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 12M | EPJ C72 2056 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 12O | EPJ C72 2151 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AALTONEN | 12AR | PR D86 112002 | T. Aaltonen <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| AALTONEN | 12N | PRL 108 211805 | T. Aaltonen <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ABAZOV | 12R | PR D85 051101 | V.M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABRAMOWICZ | 12A | PR D86 012005 | H. Abramowicz <i>et al.</i> | (ZEUS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 12AF | PRL 109 141801 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 12AG | PR D86 052013 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 12AI | JHEP 1208 110 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 12AQ | JHEP 1209 029 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| Also | | JHEP 1403 132 (errata.) | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 12AR | PL B717 351 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 12BG | PRL 109 261802 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 12BL | JHEP 1212 015 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 12BO | JHEP 1212 055 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 12BR | PRL 109 251801 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 12M | PL B714 158 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 12O | PL B716 82 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| KOSNIK | 12 | PR D86 055004 | N. Kosnik | (LALO, STFN) |
| AAD | 11D | PR D83 112006 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 11H | PRL 106 251801 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AAD | 11Z | EPJ C71 1809 | G. Aad <i>et al.</i> | (ATLAS Collab.) |
| AALTONEN | 11AD | PR D84 072003 | T. Aaltonen <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| AALTONEN | 11AE | PR D84 072004 | T. Aaltonen <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| AALTONEN | 11C | PR D83 031102 | T. Aaltonen <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| AALTONEN | 11I | PRL 106 121801 | T. Aaltonen <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| AARON | 11A | PL B701 20 | F. D. Aaron <i>et al.</i> | (H1 Collab.) |
| AARON | 11B | PL B704 388 | F. D. Aaron <i>et al.</i> | (H1 Collab.) |
| AARON | 11C | PL B705 52 | F. D. Aaron <i>et al.</i> | (H1 Collab.) |
| ABAZOV | 11A | PL B695 88 | V.M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABAZOV | 11H | PRL 107 011801 | V. M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABAZOV | 11I | PRL 107 011804 | V. M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABAZOV | 11L | PL B699 145 | V. M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABAZOV | 11V | PR D84 071104 | V. M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| BUENO | 11 | PR D84 032005 | J.F. Bueno <i>et al.</i> | (TWIST Collab.) |
| Also | | PR D85 039908 (errata.) | J.F. Bueno <i>et al.</i> | (TWIST Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 11N | PL B703 246 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 11O | JHEP 1108 005 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| CHATRCHYAN | 11Y | PL B704 123 | S. Chatrchyan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| DORSNER | 11 | JHEP 1111 002 | I. Dorsner <i>et al.</i> | |
| KHACHATRYAN | 11D | PRL 106 201802 | V. Khachatryan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| KHACHATRYAN | 11E | PRL 106 201803 | V. Khachatryan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| AALTONEN | 10L | PL B691 183 | T. Aaltonen <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| AALTONEN | 10N | PRL 104 241801 | T. Aaltonen <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ABAZOV | 10L | PL B693 95 | V.M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| DEL-AGUILA | 10 | JHEP 1009 033 | F. del Aguila, J. de Blas, M. Perez-Victoria | (GRAN) |
| KHACHATRYAN | 10 | PRL 105 211801 | V. Khachatryan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| Also | | PRL 106 029902 | V. Khachatryan <i>et al.</i> | (CMS Collab.) |
| WAUTERS | 10 | PR C82 055502 | F. Wauters <i>et al.</i> | (REZ, TAMU) |
| AALTONEN | 09AC | PR D79 112002 | T. Aaltonen <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| AALTONEN | 09T | PRL 102 031801 | T. Aaltonen <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| AALTONEN | 09V | PRL 102 091805 | T. Aaltonen <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ABAZOV | 09 | PL B671 224 | V.M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABAZOV | 09AF | PL B681 224 | V.M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ERLER | 09 | JHEP 0908 017 | J. Erler <i>et al.</i> | |
| AALTONEN | 08D | PR D77 051102 | T. Aaltonen <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| AALTONEN | 08P | PR D77 091105 | T. Aaltonen <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| AALTONEN | 08Y | PRL 100 231801 | T. Aaltonen <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |

| | | | | |
|-----------|------|----------------|-----------------------------------|---------------------|
| AALTONEN | 08Z | PRL 101 071802 | T. Aaltonen <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ABAZOV | 08AA | PL B668 98 | V.M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABAZOV | 08AD | PL B668 357 | V.M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABAZOV | 08AN | PRL 101 241802 | V.M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABAZOV | 08C | PRL 100 031804 | V.M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| MACDONALD | 08 | PR D78 032010 | R.P. MacDonald <i>et al.</i> | (TWIST Collab.) |
| ZHANG | 08 | NP B802 247 | Y. Zhang <i>et al.</i> | (PKGU, UMD) |
| AALTONEN | 07H | PRL 99 171802 | T. Aaltonen <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ABAZOV | 07E | PL B647 74 | V.M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABAZOV | 07J | PRL 99 061801 | V.M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| AKTAS | 07A | EPJ C52 833 | A. Aktas <i>et al.</i> | (H1 Collab.) |
| CHOUDHURY | 07 | PL B657 69 | D. Choudhury <i>et al.</i> | |
| MELCONIAN | 07 | PL B649 370 | D. Melconian <i>et al.</i> | (TRIUMF) |
| SCHAEEL | 07A | EPJ C49 411 | S. Schael <i>et al.</i> | (ALEPH Collab.) |
| SCHUMANN | 07 | PRL 99 191803 | M. Schumann <i>et al.</i> | (HEID, ILLG, KARL+) |
| SMIRNOV | 07 | MPL A22 2353 | A.D. Smirnov | |
| ABAZOV | 06A | PL B636 183 | V.M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABAZOV | 06L | PL B640 230 | V.M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABDALLAH | 06C | EPJ C45 589 | J. Abdallah <i>et al.</i> | (DELPHI Collab.) |
| ABULENCIA | 06L | PRL 96 211801 | A. Abulencia <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ABULENCIA | 06M | PRL 96 211802 | A. Abulencia <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ABULENCIA | 06T | PR D73 051102 | A. Abulencia <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ABAZOV | 05H | PR D71 071104 | V.M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABULENCIA | 05A | PRL 95 252001 | A. Abulencia <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ACOSTA | 05I | PR D71 112001 | D. Acosta <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ACOSTA | 05P | PR D72 051107 | D. Acosta <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ACOSTA | 05R | PRL 95 131801 | D. Acosta <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| AKTAS | 05B | PL B629 9 | A. Aktas <i>et al.</i> | (H1 Collab.) |
| CHEKANOV | 05 | PL B610 212 | S. Chekanov <i>et al.</i> | (HERA ZEUS Collab.) |
| CHEKANOV | 05A | EPJ C44 463 | S. Chekanov <i>et al.</i> | (ZEUS Collab.) |
| CYBURT | 05 | ASP 23 313 | R.H. Cyburt <i>et al.</i> | |
| ABAZOV | 04A | PRL 92 221801 | V.M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABAZOV | 04C | PR D69 111101 | V.M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABBIENDI | 04G | EPJ C33 173 | G. Abbiendi <i>et al.</i> | (OPAL Collab.) |
| ABBIENDI | 03D | EPJ C26 331 | G. Abbiendi <i>et al.</i> | (OPAL Collab.) |
| ABBIENDI | 03R | EPJ C31 281 | G. Abbiendi <i>et al.</i> | (OPAL) |
| ACOSTA | 03B | PRL 90 081802 | D. Acosta <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ADLOFF | 03 | PL B568 35 | C. Adloff <i>et al.</i> | (H1 Collab.) |
| BARGER | 03B | PR D67 075009 | V. Barger, P. Langacker, H. Lee | |
| CHANG | 03 | PR D68 111101 | M.-C. Chang <i>et al.</i> | (BELLE Collab.) |
| CHEKANOV | 03B | PR D68 052004 | S. Chekanov <i>et al.</i> | (ZEUS Collab.) |
| ABAZOV | 02 | PRL 88 191801 | V.M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABBIENDI | 02B | PL B526 233 | G. Abbiendi <i>et al.</i> | (OPAL Collab.) |
| AFFOLDER | 02C | PRL 88 071806 | T. Affolder <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| CHEKANOV | 02 | PR D65 092004 | S. Chekanov <i>et al.</i> | (ZEUS Collab.) |
| CHEKANOV | 02B | PL B531 9 | S. Chekanov <i>et al.</i> | (ZEUS Collab.) |
| MUECK | 02 | PR D65 085037 | A. Mueck, A. Pilaftsis, R. Rueckl | |
| ABAZOV | 01B | PRL 87 061802 | V.M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABAZOV | 01D | PR D64 092004 | V.M. Abazov <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ADLOFF | 01C | PL B523 234 | C. Adloff <i>et al.</i> | (H1 Collab.) |
| AFFOLDER | 01I | PRL 87 231803 | T. Affolder <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| BREITWEG | 01 | PR D63 052002 | J. Breitweg <i>et al.</i> | (ZEUS Collab.) |
| CHEUNG | 01B | PL B517 167 | K. Cheung | |
| THOMAS | 01 | NP A694 559 | E. Thomas <i>et al.</i> | |
| ABBIENDI | 00M | EPJ C13 15 | G. Abbiendi <i>et al.</i> | (OPAL Collab.) |
| ABBOTT | 00C | PRL 84 2088 | B. Abbott <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABE | 00 | PRL 84 5716 | F. Abe <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ABREU | 00S | PL B485 45 | P. Abreu <i>et al.</i> | (DELPHI Collab.) |
| ABREU | 00Z | EPJ C17 53 | P. Abreu <i>et al.</i> | (DELPHI Collab.) |
| ACCIARRI | 00P | PL B489 81 | M. Acciarri <i>et al.</i> | (L3 Collab.) |
| ADLOFF | 00 | PL B479 358 | C. Adloff <i>et al.</i> | (H1 Collab.) |
| AFFOLDER | 00K | PRL 85 2056 | T. Affolder <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| BARATE | 00I | EPJ C12 183 | R. Barate <i>et al.</i> | (ALEPH Collab.) |
| BARGER | 00 | PL B480 149 | V. Barger, K. Cheung | |
| BREITWEG | 00E | EPJ C16 253 | J. Breitweg <i>et al.</i> | (ZEUS Collab.) |
| CHAY | 00 | PR D61 035002 | J. Chay, K.Y. Lee, S. Nam | |
| CHO | 00 | MPL A15 311 | G. Cho | |
| CORNET | 00 | PR D61 037701 | F. Cornet, M. Relano, J. Rico | |
| DELGADO | 00 | JHEP 0001 030 | A. Delgado, A. Pomarol, M. Quiros | |
| ERLER | 00 | PRL 84 212 | J. Erler, P. Langacker | |
| GABRIELLI | 00 | PR D62 055009 | E. Gabrielli | |

| | | | | |
|----------------|-----|-------------------------------|--|--------------------------|
| RIZZO | 00 | PR D61 016007 | T.G. Rizzo, J.D. Wells | |
| ROSNER | 00 | PR D61 016006 | J.L. Rosner | |
| ZARNECKI | 00 | EPJ C17 695 | A. Zarnecki | |
| ABBIENDI | 99 | EPJ C6 1 | G. Abbiendi <i>et al.</i> | (OPAL Collab.) |
| ABBOTT | 99J | PRL 83 2896 | B. Abbott <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABREU | 99G | PL B446 62 | P. Abreu <i>et al.</i> | (DELPHI Collab.) |
| ACKERSTAFF | 99D | EPJ C8 3 | K. Ackerstaff <i>et al.</i> | (OPAL Collab.) |
| ADLOFF | 99 | EPJ C11 447 | C. Adloff <i>et al.</i> | (H1 Collab.) |
| Also | | EPJ C14 553 (erratum) | C. Adloff <i>et al.</i> | (H1 Collab.) |
| CASALBUONI | 99 | PL B460 135 | R. Casalbuoni <i>et al.</i> | |
| CZAKON | 99 | PL B458 355 | M. Czakon, J. Gluza, M. Zralek | |
| ERLER | 99 | PL B456 68 | J. Erler, P. Langacker | |
| MARCIANO | 99 | PR D60 093006 | W. Marciano | |
| MASIP | 99 | PR D60 096005 | M. Masip, A. Pomarol | |
| NATH | 99 | PR D60 116004 | P. Nath, M. Yamaguchi | |
| STRUMIA | 99 | PL B466 107 | A. Strumia | |
| ABBOTT | 98E | PRL 80 2051 | B. Abbott <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABBOTT | 98J | PRL 81 38 | B. Abbott <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABE | 98S | PRL 81 4806 | F. Abe <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ABE | 98V | PRL 81 5742 | F. Abe <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ACCIARRI | 98J | PL B433 163 | M. Acciarri <i>et al.</i> | (L3 Collab.) |
| ACKERSTAFF | 98V | EPJ C2 441 | K. Ackerstaff <i>et al.</i> | (OPAL Collab.) |
| BARATE | 98U | EPJ C4 571 | R. Barate <i>et al.</i> | (ALEPH Collab.) |
| BARENBOIM | 98 | EPJ C1 369 | G. Barenboim | |
| CHO | 98 | EPJ C5 155 | G. Cho, K. Hagiwara, S. Matsumoto | |
| CONRAD | 98 | RMP 70 1341 | J.M. Conrad, M.H. Shaevitz, T. Bolton | |
| DONCHESKI | 98 | PR D58 097702 | M.A. Doncheski, R.W. Robinett | |
| GROSS-PILCH... | 98 | hep-ex/9810015 | C. Grosse-Pilcher, G. Landsberg, M. Paterno | |
| ABE | 97F | PRL 78 2906 | F. Abe <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ABE | 97G | PR D55 R5263 | F. Abe <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ABE | 97S | PRL 79 2192 | F. Abe <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ABE | 97W | PRL 79 3819 | F. Abe <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ABE | 97X | PRL 79 4327 | F. Abe <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ACCIARRI | 97Q | PL B412 201 | M. Acciarri <i>et al.</i> | (L3 Collab.) |
| ARIMA | 97 | PR D55 19 | T. Arima <i>et al.</i> | (VENUS Collab.) |
| BARENBOIM | 97 | PR D55 4213 | G. Barenboim <i>et al.</i> | (VALE, IFIC) |
| DEANDREA | 97 | PL B409 277 | A. Deandrea | (MARS) |
| DERRICK | 97 | ZPHY C73 613 | M. Derrick <i>et al.</i> | (ZEUS Collab.) |
| GROSSMAN | 97 | PR D55 2768 | Y. Grossman, Z. Ligeti, E. Nardi | (REHO, CIT) |
| JADACH | 97 | PL B408 281 | S. Jadach, B.F.L. Ward, Z. Was | (CERN, INPK+) |
| STAHL | 97 | ZPHY C74 73 | A. Stahl, H. Voss | (BONN) |
| ABACHI | 96C | PRL 76 3271 | S. Abachi <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABREU | 96T | ZPHY C72 179 | P. Abreu <i>et al.</i> | (DELPHI Collab.) |
| ADAM | 96C | PL B380 471 | W. Adam <i>et al.</i> | (DELPHI Collab.) |
| AID | 96B | PL B369 173 | S. Aid <i>et al.</i> | (H1 Collab.) |
| ALLET | 96 | PL B383 139 | M. Allet <i>et al.</i> | (VILL, LEUV, LOUV, WISC) |
| ABACHI | 95E | PL B358 405 | S. Abachi <i>et al.</i> | (D0 Collab.) |
| ABE | 95N | PRL 74 3538 | F. Abe <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| BALEST | 95 | PR D51 2053 | R. Balest <i>et al.</i> | (CLEO Collab.) |
| KUZNETSOV | 95 | PRL 75 794 | I.A. Kuznetsov <i>et al.</i> | (PNPI, KIAE, HARV+) |
| KUZNETSOV | 95B | PAN 58 2113 | A.V. Kuznetsov, N.V. Mikheev | (YARO) |
| | | Translated from YAF 58 2228. | | |
| MIZUKOSHI | 95 | NP B443 20 | J.K. Mizukoshi, O.J.P. Eboli, M.C. Gonzalez-Garcia | |
| ABREU | 94O | ZPHY C64 183 | P. Abreu <i>et al.</i> | (DELPHI Collab.) |
| BHATTACH... | 94 | PL B336 100 | G. Bhattacharyya, J. Ellis, K. Sridhar | (CERN) |
| Also | | PL B338 522 (erratum) | G. Bhattacharyya, J. Ellis, K. Sridhar | (CERN) |
| BHATTACH... | 94B | PL B338 522 (erratum) | G. Bhattacharyya, J. Ellis, K. Sridhar | (CERN) |
| DAVIDSON | 94 | ZPHY C61 613 | S. Davidson, D. Bailey, B.A. Campbell | (CFPA+) |
| KUZNETSOV | 94 | PL B329 295 | A.V. Kuznetsov, N.V. Mikheev | (YARO) |
| KUZNETSOV | 94B | JETPL 60 315 | I.A. Kuznetsov <i>et al.</i> | (PNPI, KIAE, HARV+) |
| | | Translated from ZETFP 60 311. | | |
| LEURER | 94 | PR D50 536 | M. Leurer | (REHO) |
| LEURER | 94B | PR D49 333 | M. Leurer | (REHO) |
| Also | | PRL 71 1324 | M. Leurer | (REHO) |
| MAHANTA | 94 | PL B337 128 | U. Mahanta | (MEHTA) |
| SEVERIJNS | 94 | PRL 73 611 (erratum) | N. Severijns <i>et al.</i> | (LOUV, WISC, LEUV+) |
| VILAIN | 94B | PL B332 465 | P. Vilain <i>et al.</i> | (CHARM II Collab.) |
| ABE | 93C | PL B302 119 | K. Abe <i>et al.</i> | (VENUS Collab.) |
| ABE | 93D | PL B304 373 | T. Abe <i>et al.</i> | (TOPAZ Collab.) |
| ABE | 93G | PRL 71 2542 | F. Abe <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| ABREU | 93J | PL B316 620 | P. Abreu <i>et al.</i> | (DELPHI Collab.) |

| | | | | |
|---------------|-----|----------------------|--|-------------------------|
| ACTON | 93E | PL B311 391 | P.D. Acton <i>et al.</i> | (OPAL Collab.) |
| ADRIANI | 93M | PRPL 236 1 | O. Adriani <i>et al.</i> | (L3 Collab.) |
| ALITTI | 93 | NP B400 3 | J. Alitti <i>et al.</i> | (UA2 Collab.) |
| BHATTACH... | 93 | PR D47 R3693 | G. Bhattacharyya <i>et al.</i> | (CALC, JADA, ICTP+) |
| BUSKULIC | 93F | PL B308 425 | D. Buskulic <i>et al.</i> | (ALEPH Collab.) |
| DERRICK | 93 | PL B306 173 | M. Derrick <i>et al.</i> | (ZEUS Collab.) |
| RIZZO | 93 | PR D48 4470 | T.G. Rizzo | (ANL) |
| SEVERIJNS | 93 | PRL 70 4047 | N. Severijns <i>et al.</i> | (LOUV, WISC, LEUV+) |
| Also | | PRL 73 611 (erratum) | N. Severijns <i>et al.</i> | (LOUV, WISC, LEUV+) |
| STERNER | 93 | PL B303 385 | K.L. Sterner <i>et al.</i> | (AMY Collab.) |
| ABREU | 92D | ZPHY C53 555 | P. Abreu <i>et al.</i> | (DELPHI Collab.) |
| ADRIANI | 92F | PL B292 472 | O. Adriani <i>et al.</i> | (L3 Collab.) |
| DECAMP | 92 | PRPL 216 253 | D. Decamp <i>et al.</i> | (ALEPH Collab.) |
| IMAZATO | 92 | PRL 69 877 | J. Imazato <i>et al.</i> | (KEK, INUS, TOKY+) |
| MISHRA | 92 | PRL 68 3499 | S.R. Mishra <i>et al.</i> | (COLU, CHIC, FNAL+) |
| POLAK | 92B | PR D46 3871 | J. Polak, M. Zralek | (SILES) |
| ACTON | 91 | PL B268 122 | D.P. Acton <i>et al.</i> | (OPAL Collab.) |
| ACTON | 91B | PL B273 338 | D.P. Acton <i>et al.</i> | (OPAL Collab.) |
| ADEVA | 91D | PL B262 155 | B. Adeva <i>et al.</i> | (L3 Collab.) |
| AQUINO | 91 | PL B261 280 | M. Aquino, A. Fernandez, A. Garcia | (CINV, PUEB) |
| COLANGELO | 91 | PL B253 154 | P. Colangelo, G. Nardulli | (BARI) |
| CUYPERS | 91 | PL B259 173 | F. Cuypers, A.F. Falk, P.H. Frampton | (DURH, HARV+) |
| FARAGGI | 91 | MPL A6 61 | A.E. Faraggi, D.V. Nanopoulos | (TAMU) |
| POLAK | 91 | NP B363 385 | J. Polak, M. Zralek | (SILES) |
| RIZZO | 91 | PR D44 202 | T.G. Rizzo | (WISC, ISU) |
| WALKER | 91 | APJ 376 51 | T.P. Walker <i>et al.</i> | (HSCA, OSU, CHIC+) |
| ABE | 90F | PL B246 297 | K. Abe <i>et al.</i> | (VENUS Collab.) |
| ABE | 90H | PR D41 1722 | F. Abe <i>et al.</i> | (CDF Collab.) |
| AKRAWY | 90J | PL B246 285 | M.Z. Akrawy <i>et al.</i> | (OPAL Collab.) |
| GONZALEZ-G... | 90D | PL B240 163 | M.C. Gonzalez-Garcia, J.W.F. Valle | (VALE) |
| GRIFOLS | 90 | NP B331 244 | J.A. Grifols, E. Masso | (BARC) |
| GRIFOLS | 90D | PR D42 3293 | J.A. Grifols, E. Masso, T.G. Rizzo | (BARC, CERN+) |
| KIM | 90 | PL B240 243 | G.N. Kim <i>et al.</i> | (AMY Collab.) |
| LOPEZ | 90 | PL B241 392 | J.L. Lopez, D.V. Nanopoulos | (TAMU) |
| BARBIERI | 89B | PR D39 1229 | R. Barbieri, R.N. Mohapatra | (PISA, UMD) |
| LANGACKER | 89B | PR D40 1569 | P. Langacker, S. Uma Sankar | (PENN) |
| ODAKA | 89 | JPSJ 58 3037 | S. Odaka <i>et al.</i> | (VENUS Collab.) |
| ROBINETT | 89 | PR D39 834 | R.W. Robinett | (PSU) |
| ALBAJAR | 88B | PL B209 127 | C. Albajar <i>et al.</i> | (UA1 Collab.) |
| BAGGER | 88 | PR D37 1188 | J. Bagger, C. Schmidt, S. King | (HARV, BOST) |
| BALKE | 88 | PR D37 587 | B. Balke <i>et al.</i> | (LBL, UCB, COLO, NWES+) |
| BERGSTROM | 88 | PL B212 386 | L. Bergstrom | (STOH) |
| CUYPERS | 88 | PRL 60 1237 | F. Cuypers, P.H. Frampton | (UNCCH) |
| DONCHESKI | 88 | PL B206 137 | M.A. Doncheski, H. Grotch, R. Robinett | (PSU) |
| DONCHESKI | 88B | PR D38 412 | M.A. Doncheski, H. Grotch, R.W. Robinett | (PSU) |
| BARTEL | 87B | ZPHY C36 15 | W. Bartel <i>et al.</i> | (JADE Collab.) |
| BEHREND | 86B | PL B178 452 | H.J. Behrend <i>et al.</i> | (CELLO Collab.) |
| DERRICK | 86 | PL 166B 463 | M. Derrick <i>et al.</i> | (HRS Collab.) |
| Also | | PR D34 3286 | M. Derrick <i>et al.</i> | (HRS Collab.) |
| JODIDIO | 86 | PR D34 1967 | A. Jodidio <i>et al.</i> | (LBL, NWES, TRIU) |
| Also | | PR D37 237 (erratum) | A. Jodidio <i>et al.</i> | (LBL, NWES, TRIU) |
| MOHAPATRA | 86 | PR D34 909 | R.N. Mohapatra | (UMD) |
| ADEVA | 85 | PL 152B 439 | B. Adeva <i>et al.</i> | (Mark-J Collab.) |
| BERGER | 85B | ZPHY C27 341 | C. Berger <i>et al.</i> | (PLUTO Collab.) |
| STOKER | 85 | PRL 54 1887 | D.P. Stoker <i>et al.</i> | (LBL, NWES, TRIU) |
| ADEVA | 84 | PRL 53 134 | B. Adeva <i>et al.</i> | (Mark-J Collab.) |
| BEHREND | 84C | PL 140B 130 | H.J. Behrend <i>et al.</i> | (CELLO Collab.) |
| BERGSMA | 83 | PL 122B 465 | F. Bergsma <i>et al.</i> | (CHARM Collab.) |
| CARR | 83 | PRL 51 627 | J. Carr <i>et al.</i> | (LBL, NWES, TRIU) |
| BEALL | 82 | PRL 48 848 | G. Beall, M. Bander, A. Soni | (UCI, UCLA) |
| SHANKER | 82 | NP B204 375 | O. Shanker | (TRIUM) |